Transnational Associations

The review of the Union of International Associations

3/98

Images of the South

Evolution transdisciplinaire de l'université

Revue bimestrielle
mai - juin 98
Bureau de dépôt Bruxelles X

Associations transnationales

La revue de l'Union des associations internationales

Transnational Associations
Associations transnationales

Transnational Associations is a unique bilingual journal whose aim is to deal with major current problems within the perspective of international nongovernmental organizations. It is intended to provide a forum for authoritative information and independent reflection on the increasing role played by these organizations in the international system, and on its philosophical, political, economic or cultural implications.

The approach is intrinsically interdisciplinary, and calls for both specialist expertise and practitioner experience ¡n transnational association matters. *Transnational Associations* provides background information about the actions and achievements of international associations, and insight into their interrelations with intergovernmental organizations. It covers a wide range of topics, among which social organization, humanitarian law, scientific cooperation, language and culture, economic development, to cite just a few.

The programme of the review, in accordance with the principles of the UIA, clarifies general awareness concerning the association phenomenon within the framework of international relations and, in particular, informs associations about aspects of the problems which they tend to share or which are of commun interest to them. Contributors to the journal revieuw include association officers, research workers and specialists of association questions who engage only themselves.

Founded in Brussels in 1907 as the Central Office of International Associations, the UIA became a federation under the present name in 1910 at the 1st World Congress of International Associations. Activities were closely associated with the Institut international de bibliographie, which later became the International Federation for Documentation. Its work contributed to the creation of the League of Nations and the International Institute of Intellectual Cooperation (the predecessor of UNESCO). During the 1920s, the UIA created an International University, the first of its kind.

The UIA has consultative relations with UNESCO, UN/ECOSOC, and ILO. It collaborates with FAO, the Council of Europe, UNITAR, and the Commonwealth Science Council.

Associations transnationales *est la seule revue traitant des grands problèmes contemporains dans la perspective des organisations internationales non gouvernementales. Elle se propose d'apporter des éléments d'information provenant des sources les plus autorisées, propres à susciter une réflexion indépendante sur l'affirmation du rôle joué par ces acteurs dam le système international et sur les aspects philosophiques, politiques, sociaux et culturels de cette évolution.*

La visée adoptée est essentiellement interdisciplinaire et fait appel au savoir comme à la pratique des spécialistes du champ d'action des associations transnationales. Les documents, articles et études publiés par Associations' transnationales *traitent également des liens établis entre celles-ci et les organisations intergouvernementales. Les domaines couverts s'étendent aux problèmes de société, au droit humanitaire, à la coopération scientifique, aux questions linguistiques et culturelles, au développement économique on à tout phénomène affectant la vie de ces associations.*

Le programme de la revue, conformément aux buts de l'UAI, vise à éclairer l'opinion sur la signification de la dimension associative des relations internationales, notamment en informant les associations au sujet des questions qui relèvent de leurs domaines ou affectent leurs intérêts communs. Les textes des auteurs publiés par la revue (dirigeants d'associations, chercheurs et spécialistes des questions associatives) n'engagent que leur opinion.

L'UAI a été créée officiellement en 1910 à Bruxelles au cours du premier congrès mondial des associations internationales. Ses fondateurs, le Sénateur Henri La Fontaine, prix Nobel de la Paix 1913 et Paul Otlet, Secrétaire général de l'Institut international de bibliographie, avaient mis sur pied en 1907 l'«Office central des institutions internationales» auquel l'UAI succéda sous la forme de fédération. En 1914, elle regroupait 230 organisations, soit un peu plus de la moitié de celles qui existaient à l'époque. L'UAl devait incarner, dans l'esprit de ses fondateurs, les aspirations internationalistes et les idéaux de paix qui animaient les associations et qui allaient aboutir en 1920 à la création de la Société des Nations.

L'UAl a obtenu le statut consultatif auprès de ('ECOSOC, de /'UNESCO et de /'OIT. Elle collabore avec l'UNITAR, la FAO et le Conseil de l'Europe. Elle entretient des relations générales et ponctuelles avec les organisations régionales.

Contents 3/1998 *Sommaire*

Transnational Associations
Associations transnationales

Images of the South in Oxfam leaflets: construction and purpose

by Hìdeki Moro *

Introduction

It is a simple but complex question; why do people in the North participate in development of the South? Such participation is likely to be donation and volunteer work or paid work for governments, NGOs, and other organisations both in the North and in the South. If they are paid workers, they may choose it naturally as an ordinary job, although some of them face less salary and more severe working conditions in comparison to other business sectors. Moreover, some people donate their money, goods, and labour for the well-being of foreigners who are living in hundreds and thousands of kilometres away. It may be explained as a humanitarian concern toward victims as in the International Committee of the Red Cross and Oxfam UK, which were established by initiative of individual citizens.

Before people in the North are involved in development activities of the South, they come to know something about the situation of southern countries. There are many sources for information about the South. Such information is disseminated by governments, mass media, NGOs, school, parents, friends, and so on. It is not unfair to say that such information is likely to be biased because certain types of images prevail in the North. Such images are likely to be constructed by media gatekeepers and businesses which 'hold considerable powers to stereotype people in poverty and poor countries' (Sogge 1996:154). These gatekeepers and businesses use coverage of 'The bombardment of reports of horrific events...' (ibid.) to show the negative ¡mages of the South and a magazine like *National Geographic* to show images of 'an idealised and exotic world relatively free of pain or class conflict...' (Lutz and Collins 1993 in ibid.). Their communication practice requires that 'The imperatives of media-led marketing reinforce a type of 'humanitarianism' whose logic requires the presence of the Northern 'helpers' to rescue passive locals in quite controlling ways, such as 'camps' (Sogge 1996:152). This kind of communication practices reinforces the image of the incapable people with the chaotic situation of the South and the capable people with the organised manners of the North. In regarding to images of the people of the South and attitudes of the North, I actually remember that Japanese people often use the term 'Asia' with connotations of backwardness and exotic feelings. Because of that when Japanese say 'Asia,' they tend to conceive of Japan as not being in that category, even though Japan is geographically in Asia.

These mainstream mass media have a large impact on the mind of the people in the North and facilitate to construct negative images of the South, which imbues the people in the North with a biased understanding of the South. They may play a significant role to determine public attitudes toward long-term development projects and relief aid, pressure on government legislation affect on North-South relations, and some other support for diplomatic and business activities of a country. The media are, according to Gramsci (1971), used by elite classes as pedagogical tool to dominate other classes. They are used to impress elite classes' values and beliefs on the entire population that is colonising and dominating the consciousness and maintaining it.

Although NGOs are usually not the arm of elite classes, they also use such a negative image strategy to show exotic and horrifying scenes in the South. They show precious indigenous people with their cultures, which have to be "preserved." They are also likely to use harrowing pictures of starving children to appeal their constituency. In contrast to the case of elite classes, their strategies do not aim to reinforce their values and beliefs, rather because of fund-raising. Especially in case of emergence relief fund-raising campaigns, it is effective. It leads people to a 'guilt complex' (Lissner 1977:131) in which people feel sorry for victims and powerless of them against problems of the victims. Therefore, it entails negative images as a cause of feelings and attitudes.

In contrast, another thought also exists that flatters people into giving. It shows the positive images of people and makes donors feel how their contributions wonderfully worked. It makes donors feel 'Godlike feeling' (ibid.:130). This positive image causes of positive expectations and hopes because people have seen that their contribution have worked as they expect-

* Institute of Social Studies, The Hague.

Transnational Associations, 3/1998,118-129.

ed. Therefore, some NGOs found the positive image strategy works better and morally correct. For example, Oxfam made the leaflet, *Which picture?* In the leaflet, Oxfam admits:

«In the past Oxfam - and other aid agencies - ran fundraising campaigns showing starving pot-bellied children. They were relatively successful in raising money, at least for a short time. But we've learnt from our mistakes. Such poster campaigns were counter-productive. They gave the impression that people set and waited for food - or death, and that they did nothing for themselves. It was as if Oxfam was saying the response to famine should be pity - when it should be a demand for justice and action. (Oxfam 1994)».

This attempt, showing positive images, tries to stop exploiting the negative image by the pictures of the South. Because of this approach, people encounter a different image of the South, and it may result in changing their attitudes toward the South. But has this really happened? Is it possible to raise fund by only flattering constituency and showing positive images of the South? How can NGOs convince their constituencies to spend their money on foreigners by showing their upright fine images when economy at home is stagnant?

The purpose of this paper is to analyze the contents of Oxfam's leaflets, in order to investigate what kind of ¡images of the South and of the North Oxfam projects in those leaflets. These free leaflets are easily available in Oxfam shops in the United Kingdom. They are an important source of information and advertisement of Oxfam. They attempt to disseminate certain images of the South by photographs, illustrations, and texts their constituency. Besides, they are also distributed to ask donation and participation. Therefore, these leaflets are designed not only to raise consciousness among people about issues but also to make people act for the issues according to Oxfam's objectives. In this sense, the leaflets are not so much different from advertisement used in business. Advertisement in business is used to try to promote images of products, services, and companies themselves. In the same way, Oxfam tries to rave their projects, objectives, publications, organisation, volunteers, and so on.

The effect of the leaflets is difficult to assess. Some people agree on the information and decide to act, while some other people do not take an action. Not all people who have-looked the leaflets can and want to decode the message in the way Oxfam wants because the process of receiving and interpreting a message depends on a number of psychological factors, such as 'past experiences (that often operate at an almost unconscious lever), cultural expectations, motivation (needs), moods, and attitudes' (Severin and Tankard 1992:58). Even if people do not decode the message in the way Oxfam wants, they may be somewhat influenced. As a result, they may become to be interested in the activities of Oxfam.

As I posed questions, it may be difficult to cease using the negative image strategy because of its effectiveness, even though NGOs are trying to live up to their creeds. Lissner illustrates such a dilemma, 'Thus, voluntary agencies are quite often faced with an uneasy choice: either they stand publicly by their (controversial) convictions at the risk of losing income, or they sacrifice their convictions and let the need for cash dominate their actions' (Lissner 1977:227, emphasis in original). I am also interested in how NGOs present non-negative images, if not positive, of the South when they communicate with their constituency.

I collected 18 leaflets from the Oxfam information centre in Oxford and an Oxfam shop in London. I assorted them by a leaflet's purpose: consciousness raising (4), giving (5), volunteer (4), and campaign (5). Most of the leaflets are produced between 1990 and 1996.

The main subject of content analysis in this paper is text. I will examine photographs and pictures auxiliary. Since the photographs and the pictures in the leaflets are fairly represented, ordinary people may not be biased by them. As a analytical technique, I will use content analysis based on my own criteria and analysis for texts of the leaflets.

Analysis

In order to analyze the contents of the leaflets, I use three criteria: the leaflets' evaluation about the South, the activities conducted by the South, and the activities of Oxfam. The first criterion directly constructs images of the South by adjective, noun, and noun phases, such as unsecured, less fortunate, disaster, partner, poor communities, and so on. The second criterion indirectly evaluate the South by verb, such as work for, challenging, produce, and so on. The third criteria does not evaluate the South itself, but it works as a point of comparison. It expresses the image of the South in comparison to that of Oxfam, which is a representative of the North. It is examined by adjective, noun, noun phrases, and verb. Moreover, I also extract evaluation and action by texts' assumption. For example, G2 leaflets says that "£5 provides two steel irrigation pipes in Vietnam". Then it is highly feasible that people who read this assume that Oxfam will buy irrigation pipes and people of Vietnam will built irrigation system by those pipes. Thus, people induce the action probably will be taken by Oxfam and people in Vietnam. Moreover, people are likely to evaluate situations the South from a sentence. For example, a Bangladeshi woman describe a situation of her factory, "We are not allowed to get a drink of water or go to the toilet when we want to. It might take half an hour to get permission to go" (C4).

Since the leaflets are designed for four different subject, volunteer, gift, campaign, and consciousness raising, I will analyze them by the subject first then all leaflets as a whole in the conclusion. Numbers, like Al, C2, G3, etc., indicates numbers of leaflets in Leaflet Content Table at the end of this paper. In the scheme, I put title, message, and extracted contents of each leaflets.

Volunteers

Four leaflets are to recruit British volunteers, who almost exclusively work in the United Kingdom. In general, the leaflets seem likely to express the current situation of the South as poor, less fortunate (than British people who can afford to pay attention to other's lives), suffering, and distress because of hunger, disease, denied basic rights, infant death, exploitation, inequality, injustice, and so on. But there is no exotic image in these four leaflets. Activities by the South are not mentioned much.

Besides, the explanation of the South's activities is rather abstract. Only two photographs of VI mention what southern people are doing, i.e., winning miller and operating a health care centre. Since the leaflets are designed to drive British people into volunteer, all 16 photographs, except two mentioned above, and one illustration shows British people. In 13 photographs, people show their volunteer work in a positive mood. Thus the four leaflets expressed more on what Oxfam is doing and on what volunteers are doing in comparison to the evaluation and activities of the South.

The four leaflets express current negative situations of the South, but I felt that words are not used to exaggerate the situations. I also felt that the causes of the negative situation in the South are rather descriptive and less likely to be misunderstood except few abstract words, such as 'exploitation', 'inequality', and 'injustice'. Since there is no explanation for these words in the leaflets in regard to the negative situations, they are more likely to be interpreted by the British people in various different ways.

Although two (V2, V4) out of the four leaflets use the word, 'partner' and 'producer', and some words connote the activity of the people in the South, there is no real activity mentioned. There are descriptions of abstract activities, such as 'helping themselves' and 'taking control of their own future'. Before such phrases, however, it is expressed that these activities require the support of the British people. Although this expression may not impress the negative images of the South into the mind of the British people, it still connotes the dependent image of the South.

In contrast to the image of the South, the activities and evaluation of Oxfam are entirely positive and active. The leaflets, in general, express that when disaster occurs, Oxfam dispatches the places with adequate food and material to reach people, simultaneously, Oxfam focuses on long-term development plans to facilitate self-help, so that poor people can control of their own future by themselves. Thus, the leaflets seem to express that Oxfam is challenging and fighting against various symptoms of suffering in the South through various means. This is obvious from a phrase of V4, "OXFAM IS FIRST AND FOREMOST A DEVELOPMENT AGENCY" (emphasis in origin). From the cover title of VI, I am also impressed as if Oxfam tries to say that a great organisation, Oxfarn, can provide enjoyable jobs for a valuable cause with friendly people.

The purpose of the leaflets is to recruit people according to the belief and the activities of Oxfam. In this sense, it may be necessary to appeal to British people by the South's dependence on them. It is also necessary to show how the situations bad are. Although this strategy enforces negative images to induce guilt complex, which I described in the introduction, che leaflets actually use more complex and effective way; not only use the leaflets the negative images of the South but also use the positive images of the North as a point of reference. When British people read about the negative things, they feel sorry for the people in the South. They also feel complexity and massiveness of the problems; and powerlessness of them. But when they face the positive ¡mages of Oxfam, they see their involvement in Oxfam could relief them from such feelings. Since the leaflets present ordinary works, such as retail, office work, and fund-raising as a way of involvement, the complexity and the massiveness are debilitated. Furthermore, since the leaflets present Oxfam as a experienced, large, and active organisation, they feel empowered to work with Oxfam. In this sense, the British people still feel sorry about the South. But, simultaneously, they do not have to perceive themselves as a passive and negative figure, rather they tend to think that their positive and fine work can help passive and miserable people in the South.

Gift

These five leaflets adopts a more practical and more appealing way than the recruitment leaflets. Except one (G3), which appeals by bad situations of the South, all leaflets mention the activities by the people of the South and ask for donation for helping their activities. The amount of evaluation of the South is fewer than that of activities of the South. Two leaflets evaluate, and chat evaluation of the South emphasise on hardships of the South. Only one leaflet does not mention activities of the South. In regard to Evaluation and Activities of Oxfam, Oxfam mentions more concrece projects and goods than the recruitment leaflets do. As a result of that, Oxfam can explain on what and how donation and contribution of its constituencies will be used.

The five leaflets use examples and past cases to show what can be done by donation. Such examples and past cases are not negative. Even two leaflets (Gl and G2) do not evaluate the current conditions in the South at all. Some explanation of the activities, such as drill for fresh water, literacy class, grow own food, still can connote some evaluation, but they impress less than a direct expression does, e.g., lack of water, illiteracy, and hunger.

Only one leaflets (G3) does not mention about the activities of the South, but it uses a lot of words to evaluate the South. Especially, 'horrific hardship and suffering' gives a strong negative image. Only one other leaflet (C3) uses such an adjective to emphasise negative nouns. The reason of using such strong words may be that since it asks British people to knit blankets and child clothes, it may not be able to connote the necessity with activities. Moreover, 'one of the most effective ways to activate guilt complex is to "show babies, all the time show babies and more babies"' (Lissner 1977:131). Therefore, che combinación of children and strong negative words may be effective to construct guilt complex.

Overall, the five leaflets describe activities of the South and necessity of the giving by British people, rather than constructing negative images and appealing to emotion to drive people into giving. The evaluation of Oxfam is similar to that of the recruiting leaflets. But the gift leaflets connect Oxfam with specific needs of the South; for example, they express what Oxfam delivered and delivers to the South.

Campaign

These leaflets aim to mobilise people into various campaign activities. Unlike donation or purchase fair trade goods, involvement in campaigns require more energy, such us commitment and compassion. It also require ones moral conscious toward the campaign activities because donation can be driven by guilt complex, while purchase fair trade goods is not necessarily by one's conscience, rather it could be a consumer performance.

In general, these leaflets express the evaluation of the South by negative words. But these words indicate more specific situations than the words of the recruit and giving leaflets do. Activities of the South indicates only a little rhetoric, such as "fighting their poverty" in C5. Besides, they express more about evaluation than activities. These characteristics may be due to the subject whose issues and aims are clearly stated. Without stating the specific path from British people's activities to the effect on the South, the leaflets cannot impress the British people and it is impossible to mobilise the British people into campaigns. This tendency also decrease uncertainty of the leaflets' interest and misinterpretation by the British people. C5 expresses evaluation only about a half of activities. It is because C5 highlights past and ongoing campaigns that emphasise their activities. It rather introduce cases, e.g., fighting their poverty, struggling for food, and campaign land right.

Although the purpose of the leaflets is similar to that of the recruiting leaflets that is to recruit people as a volunteer mostly for fund-raising, retail, and office work, the mobilisation of constituencies into campaigns needs stronger messages to them. The recruiting leaflets strengthen messages to increase the Souths negative images by increasing the North's positive images. In other words, relative images of the South are constructed by comparison to positive images of the North. In contrast, the campaign leaflets rely more on absolute images of the South in which the images of the North ate not used as a reference point, since the campaign leaflets have to appeal people's conscience and solidarity, not for guilt complex. Therefore, these leaflets try to express the current situation in the South by concrete words in a non-negative way from non-subjective point, in order to appeal specific issues and aims.

Consciousness raising

Consciousness raising is different from three other subjects. Its purpose is neither mobilising people nor asking donation. The purpose is to disseminate information and to educate people. Because of these purpose, the leaflets does not have to use the relative image strategy to construct the positive image of the North, rather they often identify the North as a cause of the suffering in the South. For example, A4 states that, "Although most of the world's resources come from the South, most of them are used by richer countries, like the UK."

Leaflet's evaluation about the South is aware of fairness and causes of problems, e.g., very low wage, deforestation, declined soil fertility, massive unequal land ownership etc., rather than symptoms of problems e.g., poverty, denied basic tights etc. Activities of che South are a mixture of concrete ones and abstract ones. Activities of Oxfam are aware more of activities, which are to influence mind of British people. Development Education, recycle, and sustainable development are some of the examples.

The leaflets use more positive words, such as 'improve their own lives', 'working to find answers to environment problems', 'identifying problems and finding practical solutions', and so on, to describe the activities of the South in comparison to leaflets of other categories. They express about Oxfam less than the evaluation and the activities of the South in comparison to other three kinds of leaflets. Moreover, most of words used ffir evaluation are concrete words, such as environment crisis, debt, colony, drought, water pollution, and so on. There are some abstract words, such as unfair world, hopeless, daily struggle, and misery, but this kind of words are relatively fewer than the concrete words. Like the campaign leaflets, there are issues and aims. Besides the consciousness raising leaflets express background of the issues and the aims more than any other leaflets, so they are more comprehensive and less likely to be misinterpreted.

One purpose of the leaflets is to introduce the South into the North. They disseminate the facts of the South by concrete words. Therefore, there is lesser space ffir emotional aspects than three other kinds of leaflets have.

Because of this purpose, they do not have to appeal on guilt complex. They appeal on conscience, specifically the sense of justice based on plain facts. Therefore, they compare the position of the South and the North in historical, political, and economical context to illustrate the existing unjust world. Although they slightly construct negative images of the North and positive images of the South, they describe more about the position and the interdependence between the North and the South. As a result, judgement and evaluation of the South, the North, and North-South relations are mostly in the hands of the British people.

Conclusion

Although Oxfam tropes to express positive images of the South, it still shows negative images too. Depending on the subject of a leaflet, the degree of the South's ¡mage is different. The consciousness raising leaflets shows the least negative images. Although they use some abstract words, such as hopeless people and unfair, they give background explanation ffir the situations. Because of such background information, abstract words are less likely to be interpreted by constituencies as a subject of pity. The campaign leaflets also show similar tendency because they also explain some background information to impress issues and aims clearly. For these leaflets, there is a large space for the constituencies to construct the images in a positive way.

In contrast, the gift leaflets are lack of background explanation. They explain the necessity of goods and money but fail to state reasons and especially the causes. It gives constituencies a sense of the South as a passive recipient. Especially, when such giving continue without showing fruitful results or positive images of the South, constituencies become sceptical about their giving and feel so-called aid fatigue. The recruiting leaflets are in the middle between these subjects. They tend to show negative evaluación of the South and positive evaluation for Oxfam. They seem to express that working for and with the foremost organisation, Oxfam, is an accessible way to help people in the South. Therefore, che negative images of the South is increased when constituencies face to the positive images of the North.

In chis sense, the representation of the North's image is important because it affects on construction of the images of the South. The absolute images of the South are constructed by exaggeration, appeal ffir emotional feelings, and the balance between evaluation and real activities, while the relative images are constructed by the images of the North. How the North ¡s identified, e.g., a capable donor who rescues the South and works on behalf of other countries in an altruistic way etc., is a point of reference. As a strategy, it is possible to construct images by manipulating a balance between the South's information and the North's information. Such a balance can be manipulated by both quality and quantity of information.

Overall, there is a little expression of the South as a partner or of mutuel dependence. Emphasis on giving and destitution in the South express the image, They are needy victims unable to cope!' and 'Help works!' (Sogge 1996:153), even though NGOs' creeds emphasise on images, such as, They are strong people coping well!' and 'Self-help works!' (ibid.). A partner image prevents to produce pity feelings. It makes people in the North think constructive things to alleviate the destitution of the South. An image of mutuel dependence prevents "Godlike feeling". It reminds the people in the North about that they are not merely a donor but also a recipient because the North cannot survive without the South. It reminds the people in the North of their dependence on the South.

The images of the leaflets are mixed. I think that such mixed images are more natural than either" totally negatively or totally positively distorted messages. Therefore, the focus should be on related information about images. Since people image something out of a word, such as misery, drought, violence, hopeless, and so on, in their own way, it is necessary to express related información for the word to prevent misunderstanding. Otherwise, people tend to take the literally meaning of words or mix up with other words. People are also driven by emotional aspects of the word. Thus the lack of related information could be resulted in abusing the meaning. If some related information is expressed, possibility of such abuse are decreased, if not eliminated.

Finally, the role of leaflets should not be the one, which make the people in che North to have images, rather it should make the people to think about images and information in regard to the influence on the South by their everyday rives. Otherwise, The majority of people who give to an overseas development charity ate giving, not to "other people overseas", but, more accurately to "an image of other people overseas" (Lissner 1977:147).' Unless leaflets connect the rives of the people in the North and in the South, people in the North tend and want to think the problems in the South as things in a different world. If the people think that way, their commitment and compassion are not strong enough to cooperate with the South to alleviate poverty. Support of the such a type of people tends to be volatile. Their reasons for the support tend to be expedient. Their support is helpful for emergency relief aid, but it does not have enough momentum ffir long-term development projects on which most NGOs emphasise. It also makes very different people reflect on their lives' influence on the South, such as fossil fuel exhaustion, green house effects, trace barrier, and so on.

NGOs can choose a strategy to appeal their constituencies by manipulating images on leaflets. Although they may be annoyed by a dilemma, which Lissner illustrates, they need to consider, whether a leaflet for a education, which may construct some firm supporters in long-rue but takes time to construct them, or a sensation, which may raise a large number of support at a time but have to do it again every single time. It is somewhat a similar situation to a comparison between emergency relief aid and long-term development. The former prescribe projects to cure symptoms, not causes, each time, and it tend to cost more then the latter, while the latter looks in the future to overcome some problems. Many NGOs focus shifted from emergency relief aid to long-term development, so why not a strategy for a constituency building.

Bibliography

Gramsci, A. (1971) *Selection from the Prison Notebooks of Antonio Granisci*, ed. and crans. Hoare, Q. and Smith G.N. New York: International Publishers.

Lissner, J. (1977) *The Politics of Altruism: A Study of the Political Behavior of Voluntary Development Agencies*, Geneva: Lutheran World Federation.

Lutz, C.A. and Collins, J.L. (1993) *Reading National Geographic*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Oxfam. *(1994) Information from Oxfam: Which Picture?*, Oxford: Oxfam.

Severin, W.J. and Tankard, J.W.Jr. (1992) *Communication Theories: Origins, Methods, and Uses in the Mass Media*, 3rd ed. New York: Longman

Sogge, D. (1996) 'Northern Lights' in Sogge, Biekart, and Saxby (ed.) 1996.

Sogge, D., Biekart, K., and Saxby, J. (1996) *Compassion & Calculation: The Business of Private Foreign Aid*, London: Pluto Press.

Leaflet content table

Recruitment for Volunteer

	Leaflet's evaluation about the South	Activity of the South	Evaluation and Activity of Oxfam
VI: Title	Join the Team. Be an Oxfam volunteer. • An enjoyable job • among friendly people • for a valuable cause • in a great organisation • working for a fairer world		
Message	Oxfam Shop is vital to support long-term development plans. The contribution of shop volunteers is crucial. Join the volunteer at the shops.		
Content	poor communities; hunger, disease and exploitation are a way of life for poor family	helping themselves; to take control of their own future	working for a fairer world; delivery tents and technicians; conduct long-term development work;
V2: Title	OXFAM Retail experience? And a few hours to spare?		
Message	Promoting Fair Trade products is a way Oxfam is working towards a fairer world. Why not consider becoming an Oxfam volunteer?		
Content	partner; denied basic rights; poverty	produce goods	working for a fairer world; promoting Fair Trade products; ensure that a fair price is paid
V3: Title	Retired early? Join our team, have fun and help make t	e world a fairer place.	
Message	If you are recently retired and would like to use your skills to help those less fortunate than yourself, why not consider volunteering for OXFAM?		
Content	less fortunate; poverty, distress, suffering; denied basic rights; world poverty		help make the world a fairer place; relief work;
V4: Title	Volunteer for a Fairer World		
Message	Oxfam depends on volunteers. Your skill and time are needed to work for a fairer world.		
Content	less fortunate; full of injustice; poverty, hunger, infant death; exploitation; totally different part of the world; overseas partner and producer; inequality and injustice	produce goods	fight against poverty and its cause; help people challenge the exploitation and injustice; organise a

Appeal for Gift (money and goods)

	Leaflet's evaluation about the South	Activity of the South	Evaluation and Activity of Oxfam
Gl: Title	Before you give £50 or more to Oxfam STOP! Just 5 minutes of your time can make it worth a third more!		
Message	Single gift covenant makes your gift 33% more worth		
Content		child immunisation; construction work; grow their own food	donation; provide syringes, cement, and seeds
G2: Title	Giving for a Fairer World Even a little goes long way in the right hands		
Message	There are various ways to help Oxfam to help poor people who struggle to improve their lives		
Content		struggle to improve their lives; literacy class; drill for fresh water; cattle vaccination; train health workers; publish information booklet	help poor people; long-term development; donation; project partner; provide steel irrigation pipes, syringes, training for health workers, and
G3: Title	Knitting for Oxfam A way of caring		
Message	Oxfam needs knitted tops, blankets, dresses, and shorts. Your knitted goods could bring a powerful message to children and their parents that someone cares.		
Content	malnourished children, under-weight, sick, misery; traumatised children by violence and conflict; horrific hardship and suffering		deliver knitted goods; working for a fairer world
G4: Title	Oxfam a GUIDE to GIVING		
Message	To run Oxfam' various projects all over the world, your support is vital. There are many ways you can support Oxfam.		
Content	poor community	build a better future for themselves; put effort to tackle the root cause of poverty; train water engineers	help poor communities; overseas programme; working on a better deal for developing countries through education and campaigns, and the promotion of Fair Trade; provide shoes,
G5; Title	Oxfam Week Now is a good time to help		
Message	Although Oxfam is known as a relief aid agency, most of its work goes to tackle everyday poverty. The generous support of people in UK and Ireland is necessary to continue to work for a fairer world.		
Content	poverty, homelessness, lack of food and vital health care	build a school; sell cups of tea	helping people; relief aid; give a chance to learn; generous support; making changes for the

Campaign

	Leaflet's evaluation about the South	Activity of the South	Evaluation and Activity of Oxfam
Cl: Title	FAIR TRADE WORKS		
Message	Fair trade goods enable producers in the South to receive a decent pay. Buy fair trade products. Pressure on supermarkets to sell fair trade products		
Content	producers; cannot afford food, medicine, and other basic needs; children do not afford to go to school; poor health and safety regulations at work; unsecured contract for workers; not allowed to organise	producing food and crafts	working for a fairer world; sell food and crafts; guarantee fair trade; ensure direct benefit for
C2: Title	Helping people to earn a living through Fair Trade		
Message	Oxfam believes that people have a right to a life free from misery and want. The Oxfam Campaign, the biggest-ever campaign, makes it possible. To do so, Fair Trade is important in terms of generating a decent income. Buy Fair Trade products and join the campaign.		
Content	poor; unable to claim the basic rights; cannot afford food, proper housing, and money for essential medical care; people are kept poverty; without a decent income; low prices paid; coffee growers; tee plantation workers; disadvantaged;	grow crop; make crafts; working hard to overcome disadvantages	working for a fairer world; working for a life free from misery and want; help people through fair trade campaign; emergency and long-term development work; pay fair price; ensure direct trade and advance
C3: Title	the OXFAM CAMPAIGN: together FOR RIGHTS together AGAINST POVERTY		
Message	There are millions people who are denied the ten basic rights. Join Oxfam campaign to make it possible them to enjoy their rights.		
Content	denied basic rights; shortage of food; abject poverty; street children; pollution; environment disasters; violence by wars; lack of food, water, education, health care, equal opportunity and a way to be heard voice; danger livelihood for children; flood; exploited and ignored people	food and farming project; grow coffee and tee; make chocolate; produce handicrafts; build safe water facility; built school and write own text books; send children to school; child immunisation; build dikes and plant mangrove trees; question about their lives of service and poverty; camping for service; appeal to local governments	campaign to endorse rights and a total ban on mines; fund mine-clearance operations; anti-mine campaign; send shelters; support projects to give education and confidence to women; immunisation

C4; Title	SWEAT SHIRT SWEAT SHOP: Oxfam's CLOTHES CODE campaign		
Message	The work conditions in clothes factories are not easy. Some conditions are really severe and have to be changed. You can send a slip to retailers to let them know you are deeply concerned about the issue. Sign for the Oxfam Global Charter for Basic Rights to defeat poverty.		
Content	poverty; severe working conditions denied basic rights	sew on collars	fighting for fair working conditions; challenging
C5: Title	Your voice is vital; Making a difference with the Oxfam campaigning Network		
Message	Many issues hit poor people hard. Although you tend to think that you cannot do anything for them, especially from the United Kingdom, there are actually some ways. Join Oxfam campaign network to know about and stand up for various campaigns.		
Content	indebted; poor; unable to influence the decision makers in the UK and overseas; aid recipients	fighting their poverty; struggling for food, clean water, health care, better housing, education, and better working conditions; grow coffee; campaign land right	lobby for more and better aid for Africa, a cut to debt repayments, and fairer trade; campaign for

Consciousness **Raising**

	Leaflet's evaluation about the South	Activity of the South	Evaluation and Activity of
Al: Title	Fair play: How schools and youth groups can ¡oin in Oxfam's 50th Anniversary		
Message	You can do many things to make time for a fairer world. There are various activities for pupils and teachers to find out about development issues.		
Content	unfair; unequal access to food, clean water, health care, shelter, education and chance to run their own lives; hopeless people	fight for a fairer world; improve their own lives	working for a fairer world; launching various campaigns; fundraising; Development
A2: Title	It's an Unfair World		
Message	Our world is divided into rich and poor countries because there is some influence of colonialism, debt, and unfair trade. People in the North and in the South are working together to make a fairer world. Find out more about the South. Join Oxfam's activities.		
Content	unfair world; used to be rich and powerful but colonised; slaved; indebted; very low wage; lack of money to eat enough food and to buy medicine;	export raw material and import manufactured goods; smashing stones; grow coffee	working for a fairer world; Development Education
A3: Title	Our environment our future: Oxfam Education		
Message	There are many causes of deforestation. Poor people are most likely influenced by such environmental change. Join in Oxfam's work to organise Oxfam day to raise consciousness. Don't throw so much away. Use recycled paper.		
Content	poor; lack of clean air, water, and fertile soil; lack of food; displacement; deforestation; indebted;	cutting down trees; working to find answers to environment problems; planting trees; protect the forests and their lands; try to make the government agree that land belongs to them; selling land and trees	working to find answers to environment problem; working with people to protect the environment;
A4: Title	Oxfam, poverty and the environment		
Message	Oxfam is promoting sustainable development through various ways including lobby, reclaiming land, and so on. You can also do something in the UK, e.g., save electricity, drive your car more slowly, avoid to buy products made by tropical hardwood, do recycle, and support Oxfam's work.		
Content	lost cultivable land; environment crisis; depending on the natural world; daily struggle; drought; farmers; deforestation; indebted; poverty; water pollution and industrial waste; global warming; displacement; misery and hardship; rubber tappers; small-scale farmers; top-soil erosion; African girls without education; declined soil fertility; massive unequal land ownership; hampered progress	grow more crop to export and feed a growing population; mining operations, oil drilling, cattle ranches; identifying problems and finding practical solutions; large-scale ranching, and farming agriculture; reclaiming degraded land; growing food, collecting water, and gathering fuel wood; changing foods; working for an efficient stove and awareness raising; export raw material; help themselves	working for a fairer world; work with poor communities; work for sustainable environment; lobbying; recycling; work with rubber tappers and small-scale farmers; grants; support to build women's confidence; lobby; recycle;

Citizens Initiatives on Sustainable Consumption

*by Nadia McLaren **

Finding meaningful and effective approaches to sustainable consumption, which ordinary people can use at the local level, has been the primary goal of Global Action Plan (GAP) since its inception in 1990. This paper reviews the experience gained by GAP with promoting technical and research projects on sustainable consumption patterns and behaviours at the local level. It highlights the opportunities and constraints for local initiatives. It also introduces some general observations and points for debate, for instance on the role of various actors and the context within which civil society initiatives, such as those of GAP, are undertaken.

Driving forces behind consumption patterns

There are several dimensions to the context within which local initiatives must function.

I raise here questions of definition, space, finance, demographics, and time.

The Definition Dimension—what is sustainable consumption?

In our experience, it is sufficient that people can "understand" what sustainable consumption means for them, without having to understand what it means in a semantic sense.

When you look into the meaning of the words, there is a type of nonsense in the term "sustainable consumption". This does not seem to matter — at least not in the sense that it hinders action. Indeed the ambiguity has its benefits. "Sustainable development/consumption" as a conceptual icon has been able to capture the imagination of diverse constituencies precisely because it can hold within its field of meaning so many polarities and debates, understandings and misunderstandings. It holds the economic definition [1 2], the thermodynamic definition, the materials/resources definition [3], the social and ecological definitions [4] and the ethical and equity definitions [5 6]. It has also become a rallying call for many spiritual positions and humanitarian aspirations [7]. In this sense, it is not the term that is important, but the achievement of potential for integration [8].

A "common-or-garden" definition of sustainable consumption

Human beings are remarkable in that we can adopt understandings chat are relevant to us, and filter out the test. We have places inside us that can hold values alongside facts alongside feelings alongside rational thought. We also have "common sense", a wonderful instinct that if used well can cut through a lot of irrelevance. These human abilities can be invaluable resources in underpinning successful local action.

Sustainable consumption for most people seems to be related to notions such as "better consumption", "thoughtful consumption", "consuming less", "living more simply", "making less pollution" and generally "making less mess of the earth". It is very possible for people to make a bag of such definitions operational at the individual and local level, and with intention, application and common sense achieve a great deal.

A rider needs to be added, however. Even though common understandings of sustainable consumption may be perfectly adequate to guide citizens in transforming their behaviour m daily life, they may lack perspectives that are important for collective action - say as an organisation or a local community.

A working definition of consumption

It is therefore also helpful to have definitions that integrate understandings from wider spheres. My preferred definition works from the premise that a one of consumption should not foreclose, at this stage, on any significant actors, driving forces, their interrelationships, or the various possible ways to control consumption's impacts. It assumes that unsustainable consumption is consumption with environmentally important, undesirable consequences. This approach is workable m almost any cultural context and at any scale, global to local; it is based on fundamentals; it is explicit about what really matters (like health)' people and ecosystems) rather than surrogates

** In collaboration with Marilyn Mehlmann. Prepared on behalf of Gobal Action Plan

tion to the Workshop on Encouraging Local Initiatives Towards Sustainable Consuption

sion for Europe (ECE), 2-4 February 1998, Vienna).

(1) Consumption involves che use of goods and services to meet current wanes. (Pearce, 1994).

(2) A simple and common defin-

consists of goods and services

(public consumption). The level

mined by a number of factors: 1) Income (money) available for consumption; 2) Price of the goods and services; 3) Technolo-

and services consumed; and 4) Tastes and preferences of the consumers (Stern, 1995).

(3) Sustainable production and consumption means using, transforming, and disposing of

while supporting the well being of people. (International Institute for Sustainable Development, undated).

[can] be defined as a level of con-

of people the world over, from all sectors of society, without compromising the sustainability of the environment and its life-support system". (Abraham, undated).

(5) The Oslo Roundcable on Sustainable Production and Consumption in 1994 proposed a working definition of sustainable consumption as "the use of

to basic needs and bring a better quality of life, while minimising the use of natural resources, toxic materials and emissions of waste and pollutants over the life cycle, so as not to jeopardise the needs of future generations". (Ofstad, 1994).

Transnational Associations, 3/1998,130-147.

like money 9; and still it is open-ended and non-normative about what is valuable.

Consumption consists of human transformations of materials and energy. Consumption is environmentally important to the extent that it makes materials or energy less available for future use, moves dynamically stable, biophysical systems toward a different state or. through its effects on those systems, threatens human health, welfare, or other things people value [10].

Some important points are implicit in this definition:

1. Consumption is a human-environment transacción [11]. Its causes (driving forces) ace economic and social but its effects are biophysical. The study of consumption therefore lies at che interface of the social and natural sciences and seems to require their collaboration.
2. Consumption is defined by biophysical categories such as coal and carbon dioxide, forests and fields, rather than by social categories such as money or status. It follows that the appropriate units primary for measuring consumption are physical and biological rather than economic or social.
3. Producers and distributors also transform materials and energy. Production and consumption are two faces of the same coin; in this sense, production is consumption.
4. What people do as consumers is not necessarily consumption. Our activities may be more or less consumptive. Approaching the pure case is the purchase of information. Some economic activity even reduces net consumption, for example when a firm uses its own or another firm's wastes as an input to production.
5. Services and investment are consumption if they have major environmental consequences. Non-economic activity (e.g. amateur sports, religious ritual) can also transform materials and energy.
6. All human beings and societies, not just the affluent ones, consume. The drastically different quantities and qualities of consumption around the world are important subjects for empirical investigation.

Such a broad definition of consumption brings sustainable consumption very close to sustainable development [12]. It would imply that persons who advocate growth in the rates of consumption of resources are advocating unsustainability. Can it be so simple? This reflection, however, is exactly where we are - at a point where the reliable thermodynamic, biophysical and economic definitions of sustainable consumption fall short and the perplexing ethical, social and ethnological aspects come into play, creating the gap between policy and practice.

The scale dimension

Subsidiarity

The concept of subsidiarity, emphasised by the EU, can as well be applied to products as to decision processes. In both areas, a trend to the opposite of that desired can be discerned.

In its signal report on the environmental aspects of road transport of goods, the Wuppertal Institute noted that since 1950 the volume of goods taken over long distances by road in Europe has doubled while that of goods taken up to 50 km (within the locality) has stayed roughly the same [13]. "Product miles" are still growing. In the foreseeable future freight transport is expected to increase on European roads by at least 70 percent and 100 percent across EC borders

The real cose of transport is seldom reflected in the price of products. The problem is that fossil fuels, such as petrol and diesel, are remarkably cheap. The price of the fuel itself does not reflect the cost of providing the roads on which the vehicles travel. Nor does it reflect the cost of the environmental damage that burning fossil fuel creates; nor the cose of developing alternatives when the oil wells run dry.

For much of what we consume, there are local suppliers of locally produced products. There is ample potential for individual and local action to ameliorate environmental impact. For example, repairing and reusing imported products effectively reduces their transport burden on the environment. Requiring fewer drugs by keeping healthier, or using preventive health services, has local economic spin-offs.

GAP stresses local consumption as a

(6) Sustainable development *[read* consumption] is seen as consisting of three major interrelated elements: 1. the carrying capacity of natural-resource bases within delimitable ecological "niches": local, national, regional and global; 2. a fair share of sustainable surpluses and sustainable productive activity, on both che national and global levels, for all members of living generations; 3. similar fair shares for the members of future generations. The concept thus implies a normative interdependence between a dimension of ecological balance and a dimension of spatial and temporal justice. (Lafierty, 1994).

(7) Lifestyles "within the bounds of the ecologically possible and to which all can reasonably

Environment and Development, 1981).

(8) Dovers and Handmer, undated.

(9) In a survey of the US Merck Family Fund, people were asked

The responses were striking:

by huge margins (Harwood Group, 1995).

(10) Stern, 1995.

(11) It should not be forgotten that trees are producers and consumers also. They have the advantage over humans of having an unlimited energy source. Humans, in the biological sense, are animals, processors and consumers only.

(12) ..and some may chide "the universe and everything". I write this without the advantage of reviewing the report of the OECD Rosendal Workshop, which had as one of its key objectives "to clarify the boundaries between 'sustainable development' and 'sustainable consumption'. (Organisation for

Development, 1995).

(13) To produce a glass jar of strawberry yoghurt for sale in Stuttgart, strawberries were transported from Poland to west *UK.* Germany and then processed into jam to be sent to southern Germany. Yoghurt cultures came from north Germany, corn and wheat flour from the

Netherlands, sugar beet from east Germany, and the labels and aluminium covers for the jars were made over 300 km away.

foundation for sustainable consumption. It provides guidelines for household purchasing; and more importantly, it gets people talking about the matter. Where a product comes from becomes a relevant question from the point of view of sustainable consumption. Awareness-raising (in an empowering way) is probably the most important and the most long-term dimension of our work. Products may change, choices may change, but good habits and attitudes, once learned, rarely do. When faced with different brands and no taste preference, picking the one manufactured close to where you live is not going to be a bad choice.

Urban-rural development

Another example of scale factors in sustainable consumption is the difference between city and rural areas.

On the one hand, the consumption of services in cities is generally much more sustainable than in country areas. On that basis, urban migration and a clearer definition of urban-rural boundaries might be one strategy to improve the level of sustainable consumption [14].

On the other hand, cycles that work in rural areas - natural cycles - often don't work well in the city. Natural ecocycles assume that the substances we use are degradable and can be regenerated in the natural environment. A characteristic of such substances is that they become dispersed so that they do not occur in unnatural amounts or concentrations.

Technical cycles - those which we create with our own technology — assume, on the other hand, that the substances that are to be re-used are persistent and that they occur in large volumes or high concentrations. The city makes technical cycles, and "ecological engineering" for sustainable consumption possible [15].

It is clear that most programmes and projects that promote local development are likely to carry sustainable consumption benefits. The Rocky Mountain Institute has led the way in the USA in the practice of sustainable "Local Economic Renewal" [16], as has Robert Theobald [17] and others in its theory.

In Europe, local redevelopment has not been missing from the agenda, but often lacks the specific sustainable platform as one of its key objectives. On the other hand, Local Agenda 21 planning, which has been taken up enthusiastically in many European countries [18 19 20], generally gives less priority to economic and business agenda [21]. The Netherlands is a notable exception; local/regional thinking is seen at the focus of current social trends; policy interest is already occurring in the areas of "Rejuvenating regional ecology" in the interests of developing more sustainable lifestyles. "People need a regional identity while retaining their personal ego - 'Couleur locale' will be the key" [22]. Austria also is experimenting with a model called "region-integrated local supply" or "pro-local supply". This is more than just promoting local consumption. It is a self-organizing concept for a region, which heightens individual responsibility and initiative in all areas of quality of life and proximity [23] Closer identification with their community enables citizens to move to sustainable consumption patterns, and helps people to maintain and develop their cultural identity in the face of pressures to adopt unsustainable lifestyles.

The financial dimension

Globalisation of trade and investments

About 40% of world trade is undertaken by global corporations; their inter-company trade alone accounts for one-third of the world's manufactured trade volume [24]. The Multilateral Agreement on Investment (MAI), being negotiated by the countries of the OECD in the first instance, is designed to establish the "national treatment" principle. In granting foreign investors the same rights as local investors, countries will also be deprived of an important instrument of policy - regulating foreign investment - notably controls over entry into certain sectors, levels of local participation, and the repatriation of funds.

Examples from around the world show that it is unrealistic to assume that foreign companies will be stretching their environmental performance beyond national requirements or applying eco-efficiency principles in excess

Only the glass jar and the milk were produced locally. (Böge, 1993).

(14) Jernalöv and Jernalöv, 1996.

(15) Waste paper, for example,

- one recognising its "natural"

ecosysterns, where dependability and dilution represent a benefit, and one which takes advantage

tion. 1. If paper is recycled as much as the fibre quality allows — perhaps 80 pet cent — the source of raw materials fot paper mills will primarily coincide with the market, i.e. the urban regions. 2. In rural areas, there is a fit between the opportunity to

smaller amounts of dispersed

ment, paper is probably best treated as compos table material for soil enrichment. These two solutions require different social

and technologies. (Jernalöv and Jernalöv, 1996).

(l6) Rocky Mountain Institute, 1977.

(17) Theobald, 1998.

(18) International Council for Local Environmental Initiatives, 1997.

(19) European Academy of the Urban Environment, 1996.

(20) Lafferty and Eckerberg, 1997.

(21) Rushmoor Borough Council, 1994.

(22) Edelkoon, 1996.

(23) Kanatschnig, Retzl and Schmidt, 1997

(24) Sylvan, 1997.

of relatively shore-term business dictates.

Globalisation of investment also affects consumption issues. According to UNCTAD, global corporations control about one-third of the world's productive assets in che private sector, and their overseas investment is "a bigger force in the world economy than world trade". Most estimates are that less than 10% of the trading volume - some $640 billion a day according to the Bank of International Settlements — any link to the purchase of foreign goods and services. In other words, trade in money is now quite tenuously linked to the world's productive activities [25].

The ever-expanding scale of the global economy obscures the consequences of our actions. In effect, our arms have been so lengthened that we no longer see what our hands are doing [26]. Anxiety and uncertainty over global scale situations can cast a pall over modest local initiatives. GAP takes it as one of its key roles to work with the psychological fallout of despair, denial and a sense of futility. It is essential for the success of local initiatives that the community sees their actions as making a difference, valuable in their own right. One way that GAP does this is by ensuring that results are reported in a way that they can be aggregated and shown to be part of a much larger and globally significant effort [27].

Stakeholder involvement

Another way is to ensure broad stakeholder support of GAP community campaigns at the local level. Wherever possible, this includes financial and in-kind support. Distant financing of projects can often have undesirable consequences. A strong local level coherence is otherwise lacking in many "local" initiatives with external funding. The auditors of EC-funded projects are currently concerned at the number of initiatives that "die" once the funding cycle is completed.

Enabling role of charities and non-profits

The largest part of the financial support for local and community initiatives relevant to sustainable consumption comes from the philanthropic and non-profit sector. For example, che Soros Foundation spent SUS 4 million in 1994/95 to provide e-mail and full Internet access to individuals and organisations in Central & Eastern Europe as well as the non-Slavic republics of the NIS. Their object was to build the capability of communities to take local initiatives for sustainable development [28].

Foundations are a growth industry in the USA. In 1990 there were some 32,000 private foundations. Among them, they controlled $137 billion in assets and distributed nearly $8 billion in grants annually. This reflects - and outstrips — a general rise in private giving for human services during a decade characterised by tight containment in public outlays [29]. For some foundations, nonetheless, there can also be a considerable lead-time in their adjustment to emerging needs and opportunities.

There is a growing need for individuals and organisations that can not only be the communicators between the different worlds of charities, governments, NGOs, and local initiatives, but also provide the consulting expertise to transmit capacity and train needed skills.

The demographic dimension

Population

Size and growth of the human population has been little taken up so far in the discussions on sustainable consumption [30 31]. This is partly because most are now aware of the irony that every new person born in the "developed" countries will be responsible for the consumption of between 10 and 40 times that of a person born in a disadvantaged country; the compound effect over several generations is even more startling [32]. There is also a discouraging feeling that savings made by large efforts towards resource efficiency can be easily and completely wiped out by the added resource needs of modest increases in population [33].

In addition, in ECE countries, it is the rate of household formation, not population growth, which is tied to consumption. In Europe, the number of households has been steadily growing for two decades, as the size of the average household has diminished [34]. A very powerful role of local initiatives would be supporting the reintroduction into the modern household milieu of the resource-sharing bene-

(25) One could wonder whether the objective of decoupling production from resource consumption *his* not already been preceded by a decoupling of production from "capital consumption , and its implications for consumption generally.
(26) Shiva, 1996.
(27) GAP'S motto is "you don't have to be just a drop in the

bucket". Alternatively "If you think you are too small to count, you have never shared your bed with a mosquito".
(28)
(29)Schroeder, 1992.
(30) "[A]t the same time as the

the West was dropped from the UNCED agenda, another major issue was also removed: popula-

world. These two issues may

respects, since one may — perhaps optimistically — postulate a

tion" [in the West] analogous to

an ultimate levelling off in global population levels." (McNeill, 1994).
(31) Sustainability requires that the size of the population be less than or equal to the carrying capacity of the ecosystem for the desired standard of living.
a) Sustainability requires equi-

and stable ecosystems.
b) Destruction of ecosystems tends to reduce the carrying capacity and/or the sustainable standard of living.
c) The rate of destruction of

of growth of the population increases.
d) Population growth rates less than or equal to zero are necessary, but are not sufficient, conditions for halting the destruction of the environment. (Barlett).
(32) The average rich-nation citizen used 7,4 kilowatts (kW) of energy in 1990 — a continuous flow of energy equivalent to that Peering 74,100-watt lightbulbs. The average citizen of a

only l kW. There were *1.2* billion people in the rich nations, so
their total environmental "impact, as measured by energy use was 1,2 billion x 7,4 kW, or 8.9 terawatts (TW) — 8.9 tril-

fits of larger families and close neighbours. This is an example of the type of participative research, which could very usefully be supported, and which carries many other potential benefits to the community.

Quantitative approaches

Over the last few years, a number of concepts have been developed that enable sustainable consumption to be calculated more precisely. These concepts can be used by local initiatives both to set their targets for action and as benchmarks against which to measure their achievements. They also are useful for comparative purposes between regions.

Environmental space relates to the sum total of what the Earth can provide for us — our resource base for consumption and that for future generations [35]. Adding the dimension of time, it becomes the sustainable rate of exploitation of any resource: replenishable, like fresh water; renewable, like land and nature's capacity to assimilate pollution and other forms of environmental stress; and non-renewable, like fossil fuels and biodiversity. Environmental space is often supplemented by the equity principle which states that every person on the planet is entitled to an equal share of the Earth's resources [36 37].

The *ecological footprint* of any specified population is the total area of productive land and water required on a continuous basis to produce all the resources consumed, and to assimilate all the wastes produced, by that population, wherever on Earth that land is located [38]. Ecological footprints take account of bioregional considerations. They can be calculated at any scale from global down to the individual. According to ecological footprint analysis, if all earth's inhabitants were to consume resources at the rate of the USA, we would require three planet Earths to support us. Ecological footprints tend to be smaller in Europe, but Europeans have larger ecological deficits, referring to the land they use for domestic production in other countries.

Two additional Earths would be needed to achieve the Brundtland Commission's objective of raising the developing world to the first world's present material standards [39]. Except for a very small proportion of the world's population, our ecological footprints are too large for the earth's carrying capacity [4o]. This means we are appropriating resources at a faster rate than natural replenishment rates, depriving future generations and stressing earth systems.

Environmental space and ecological footprint are spatial concepts. The term ecological rucksack was developed to hold the notion of the 'total material inputs' — the physical masses of raw materials moved around the Earth by economic activity, be it mineral mining, earthworks for agriculture and dams, or building materials. The concept points to the environmental burden entailed by materials import: extracting the raw materials, their shipping and processing, manufacturing, consumption, recycling and, ultimately, their disposal as waste.

The ecological rucksack caused by German consumption patterns is 50 tonnes per person per year. According to the Wuppertal Institute, the precautionary principle requires that such material flows should, within the next few decades, be reduced by roughly half worldwide, and in the industrialised parts of the world by a factor often, i.e. by 90%, for each of the five categories: biotic (living) and abiotic (non living) raw materials, soil, water and air [41].

Sustainable Europe Campaign [42]

Using the tools described above, Friends of the Earth and their collaborators ate working on "Sustainable [my Country]" campaigns in countries throughout Europe [43 44 45 46]. These are sustainable future plans which develop "sufficiency scenarios" based on analysis of what the nation currently consumes, what its environmental footprint should be and the steps for transition, sector by sector.

The time dimension

Time and time scales are important for a number of reasons.

Human and natural systems typically have very different temporal characteristics (compare, for example, time scales of elections, government budgets, and corporate planning

ple lived in poor nations in 1990, hence their total impact (at 1 k\V a head) was *4.1* TW. The United States has more than a quarter of a billion people. Each, on average, uses 11 kW of

average Japanese, more than

age Spaniard, and over 100 times as much as an average Bangladeshi. Clearly, achieving an average family size of 1.5 children in the United Stares (which would still be larger than the 1.3 child average ¡n Spain) would

Bangladesh. (Ehrlich, 1994). It

but *size.* The diet of an average American is now 20 times the energy input of 200 years ago! If the total load on the biosphere were to be held constant at the

tion a little mote than those of modern-day Portugal would equal the global average. As a

imply different things for differ-

threefold increase for Africa to a reduction to one-fifth of the present level for North America. (Dovers & Handmer, undated).

(33) This is "Bartlett's ninth law" (Bartlett, undated).

(34) The corollary is that che size of che average household, as measured by the number of persons per household, has diminished in most ECE countries (by up to 29 percent in the case of Denmark during the 1980s and in 1990 averaged 1.7 persons). *4.4* million single-person households are expected to be created in the UK over the next 20 years (Gummer, 1996).

(35) A purely spatial concept of

logically productive land "available" per capita on Earth, currently about 1.5 hectares. A "fair seashare" (ecologically productive ocean - coastal shelves upwellings and estuaries - divided *by* total population) is just over 0.5 ha. (Rees. 1996).

(36) van Brakel and Buitenkamp, 1993.

(37) Oivind Fjeldstad, undated.

(38) Wackernagel and Rees, 1996.

(39) "We would need an additional two planet Earths to accommodate the increased eco-

versus perhaps fifty years' production cycles in a hardwood plantation forest, cumulative change in the atmosphere, or the formation of soil). A major implication of the rise of the moral principle of intergenerational equity is to force institutional systems to think over time-scales chat are somewhat closer to chose of natural systems.

In the concext of rapid change, we may find ourselves short of time. The transition economies of the CEE have shown how quickly forms of unsustainable consumption can accelerate. The purchasing power parity of China, India, Brazil and Russia rates them amongst che top 10 in the world. These four nations cover over a fifth of che world's land surface and are home to more than one-third of its population; yet their per capita income levels are still relatively modest compared to those of leading economies.

Time can be just as difficult for the opposite reason; the length of time chat it takes to achieve a desired result. Different cultures can have quite differing attitudes to time, as can different generations. Many regard the lack of synchronisation wich natural cycles and loss of sensitivity to nature's rhythms as the chief dysfunction of modern societies contributing to unsustainable behaviour [47].

It is clear that getting the world onto a sustainable consumption trajectory will cake decades. Current capital stocks of physical infrastructure, for example in housing, energy, transportation and waste management, can lock societies into unsustainable patterns of consumption over which individual consumers have little influence.

Time is a significant factor for both environmental space and sustainable consumption. Environmental space increases at the rate of consumption of resources decreases, making environmental shares larger. Sustainable consumption per capita will increase, relative to environmental shares, if:

* more efficient production technologies become available,
* consumer preferences become less resource-intensive,
* net investments decrease, or
* people ace willing to spend more of their cime working (and the labour market functions so that these desires are fulfilled) [48].

Nature's economy

Two economic systems exist alongside the market economic system: nature's economy of life-support processes and a people's economy by which societal values are exchanged and non-material needs are met [49]. Economic analysis is based on the circular flow of exchange value (money flows) through che economy. Prevailing economic models of growth and sustainability thus lack any representation of the physical flows, transformations of materials, energy sources, and time-dependent processes basic to ecological economics [50]. Formal market models treat human behaviour as if it were rational only; nor can they hold che values such as quality, sharing and caring [51]. When it comes to explaining why consumption patterns have changed over time, economic theory has little to offer [52].

Strategic approaches

We here outline strategic aspects of the GAP approach to developing more sustainable consumption patterns.

Working with attitudes and conscious behaviour change

The EcoTeam programme is concerned with sustainable consumption *patterns*, and starts at the *individual and household* level. By "patterns" we mean repeated sets of characteristics, behaviours, habits, lifestyles, ways of chinking about, and so on. We support the development of attitudes that are capable of modifying patterns of consumption, which might inicially be summarised as follows:

There are problems.
The problems are bigger than me.
But I can contribute to a solution.
I can contribute as an individual, by my own actions.

logical load of people alive today. If the population were to stabilise at between 10 and 11 billion sometime in the next . century, five additional Earths would be needed, all else being equal — and this just to maintain the present rate of ecological decline. To achieve the objective of raising all living standards, the Brundtland Commission argued for "more rapid economic growth in both industrial and developing countries" and suggested that "a five to ten fold increase in world industrial output can be anticipated by the time world population stabilises some time in the next century". (Rees, 1996).

(40) An environment's carrying capacity is its maximum persistently supportable load. (Catton, 1986).

(41) Wuppertal Institute for Climate. Environment and Energy, 1997.

(42) H. Spangenberg, 1995.

{43) Friends of the Earth Scotland, undated.

(44) Friends of the Earth Netherlands, 1990.

(45) Wuppertal Institute for Climate, Environment Energy, 1995.

(46) Mille, 1995.

(47) Shiva, 1996.

(48) Mille, 1995.

(49) ibid.

(50)Rees,1996.

it makes no sense to make shoes last ten times as long, unless

as much labour and fetch more than ten times the price per pair. This would be negative economic growth; as would sharing a boat between two families rather than buying one each. (Hille, 1995). On the other hand, eco-

count in instances where the social welfare benefit is neutral in monetary terms. Consider the following: road accidents will reduce the life of one in SO EU citizens by an average 40 years and will result in one in three going to hospital; each road death costs 1 million ecu; the total of costs to the European community of road accidents is virtually the same as the total production costs of the European car industry (European Ministry of Transport. pers. cornm.).

(52) McNeill,1994

And I can contribute as a citizen, e.g. by joining pressure groups, voicing my opinions, and voting.
I care about the earth, and I will do whatever I can and I believe that participating in this project/programme is a good way for me to contribute,

Critical programme development questions

Questions that are focussed in the design of GAP programmes are, for example:

- Are people in the affluent countries really prepared to adopt a more sustainable lifestyle?
- What does "sustainable consumption" mean for the man and woman in the street - big sacrifices or modest cut-backs, or perhaps even an improvement in the quality of life?
- How big are the potential savings (for the environment and the pocket book) of behavioural change?
- What is needed to help one person change behaviour?
- What is needed for a behaviour change to become established habit?
- How can the process become self-extending (become independent of constant reminders), to be maintained and progressively deepened?
- How can large numbers of people be reached within a reasonable period of time with the least possible input of work and other resources?

The questions are primarily behavioural rather than what is normally thought of as "environmental". GAP has therefore sought out disciplines which are relatively untapped by environmental movements. In particular we have found it necessary to adopt a cross-disciplinary and cross-sectoral perspective.
In the course of our work we have found that, while the environmental content of our programmes needs to be heavily adapted to each participating culture, the answers to the behavioural questions are much more universal. In the following, we describe opinion surveys indicating answers to some of the above questions, outline the principles of empowerment and of social diffusion, and discuss the merits and demerits of information and behaviour-change campaigns.

(53) Harwood Group, 1995.
(54) Hareide, 1996.
(55) Gershon and Straub, 1991.
(56) Mehlmann, 1995.

Opinions and surveys

Many surveys show that the majority of people in the affluent countries would like to adopt a more sustainable lifestyle but:
* doubt that others feel the same
* experience themselves as powerless in relation to both environmental problems and to societal development in general
* don't know where to begin.

A survey made by a foundation ¡n Washington [53] showed for example that close to *two thirds* of the population value family, community and health ahead of possessions, salary and status; but less than one third believe others feel the same. A Norwegian survey [54] gives similar results.

The Merck Family Fund contracted a survey of the US "market" for GAP's EcoTeam programme. They found that 43% of respondents were prepared to attend an information meeting about the programme. Statistics show that around 80% of those who attend such meetings actually join the programme. The independent consultants who conducted the survey conclude that the goals of GAP USA regarding recruitment to teams - that is, to recruit 10-15% of the population in selected neighbourhoods to an ambitious behaviour-change programme - is fully realistic.

Empowerment

The principles of empowerment are at the heart of GAP programmes [55]. Empowerment can be viewed both as a condition and as a process [56].

The *condition* of empowerment implies a feeling of being reasonably in charge of a situation. The condition can be general (I feel in charge of my life) or specific (when my children are threatened, *1* become a tiger).

The increasing interest in this phenomenon over the past two decades may be connected with the spread all over the world of a growing feeling of powerlessness. Many people today experience a lack of choice in their lives at any level. This experience seems to be at least, if not more, widespread in the affluent countries as m the poorer and is thus an expression less or "fact" than of perception.

An empowerment *process* is either inner (I learn to progressively experience more control over my own life), which can be compared to a general maturation process; or the result of external support, for example through an empowerment programme.

A coach usually leads an empowerment programme. The task of the coach is to support participants so that they progressively learn to take (and experience that they are taking) more power over their own situation, in general or specifically in relation to a given area, for example in relation to environmental questions.

Empowerment is sometimes compared with or even confused with quite different phenomena, for example motivation, delegation or "cheering on". A significant difference is that the empowerment process is rooted in the individual's own maturation process and is therefore comparatively little dependent on external inputs. For a coach it is a question of bringing forth rather than pushing forward.

The principles of empowerment are integrated into GAP programmes, including the EcoTeam workbook, the coach training, and the design of the actual EcoTeam process.

Social diffusion

The processes governing diffusion of behavioural change have been the subjects of much research. The results are used primarily by marketers and advertisers in order to prevail upon as many people as possible to change their purchasing behaviour as fast as possible.

From our perspective, sustainable consumption is likely to grow from conscious, informed choice rather than "market-directed" mechanisms.

We have developed our community programme based on the same research findings, and believe our programmes should be more effective and more sustainable than an equivalent public relations campaign because:

- we offer support for a *conscious* decision to change behaviour
- we help create understanding of the *reasons* why the new behaviour is preferable to the old
- participants are supported to establish the new behaviour *as a habit*

Some of the basic rules for effective behaviour change programmes that can be derived from social diffusion theory [57] are:

- concentrate efforts on groups with natural contact with each other, for example neighbourhoods
- address first efforts to the "early adopters", or potential pioneers
- see that the early adopters' changes are publicised
- see that the new behaviour appears in some way successful to others - better, cheaper, trendier, and more fun
- not to waste time on those whose concerns are otherwise.

To campaign or not to campaign

Many studies document the strengths and weaknesses of information campaigns as a tool for behaviour change. One major work [58] concludes that "education can make a difference in people's behaviour, but there are serious limits to what it can accomplish". Information does not in itself lead to behavioural change.

There is a considerable difference between a traditional information campaign (and an awareness raising campaign), and an empowerment programme.

Behaviour changes triggered by an information campaign

Traditional methods build on an information/media campaign directed at households or individuals, which is limited in time and often intensive (and expensive). The anticipated effect is postulated from a linear model without feedback:

information —> knowledge —> attitude —> values —> behaviours

However, we people seldom function according to chis model. Instead, in the best case we experiment with new behaviours. When our imagination is tickled, we search out new sources of knowledge. When behaviour

(57) Rogers, 1983.
(58) Gardner and Stern, 1996.

and knowledge "feel right", we can afford to change our attitudes and values.

We can afford to care about problems to the extent that we believe we can do something about them. Action therefore often needs to pre-date changes of values, in order to establish the feasibility of the project. Without perceived feasibility, we tend to adopt coping strategies like ignoring the problem ("it's not really so bad"), preaching the impossibility of doing anything, or paying dues to someone who is supposed to fix it.

An information campaign therefore starts at the most difficult end. Its effects are not sustained and typically decline to around 10% when the immediate effects of the campaign have worn off.

Behaviour changes triggered by an active, conscious process

The EcoTeam programme builds upon a cyclical, self-reinforcing process:

caring —> meeting —> seek others who care —> behaviour out

knowledge

experimenting with new behaviour

caring more <— feedback

Multicultural experience with EcoTeams

Our programmes have reached the effectiveness they have today through seven years of field testing in a diversity of cultures and settings. This has been done in active partnership with tens of thousands of EcoTeam participants, coaches, and coordinators. We have discarded more beloved notions than I care to remember, all the time simplifying and clarifying the elements of what works, what makes sense. We are not there yet but the results to date are anyway exceptional.

At the University of Leiden in the Netherlands researchers have studied the EcoTeam programme. They found that, on average, each participating household adopted 28 new behaviours during the programme [59].

(59) Staats and Harland, 1995.

When followed up 9-12 months later they retained on average 22 of the new habits; and 43% of the households had also adopted a number of new, environmentally sounder behaviours so that the overall result (two years later) was over 100% (rather than the more typical 10%). Research continues in Leiden.

We believe the EcoTeam process is effective because participants have control and can choose to act in relation to their resource use. The team offers a "safe" environment in which to experiment and to grow towards new attitudes and values.

Other research programmes have now begun in Utrecht (Netherlands), Switzerland, che UK and the USA, and are planned in Sweden. With the exception of the UK, they are studying a programme which, while on the environmental level it differs considerably, at the design level is remarkably similar. The elements of empowerment and social diffusion designed into the programme include for example:

- *feedback at several levels*
  - each household is enabled to monitor its own progress
  - each household can see its contribution to the community and/or the national programme
  - country results are summarised and circulated both to EcoTeams, to local and national governments, and to intergovernmental organisations
- *high degree of self-organisation*
  - each member of a team is expected to take responsibility for running a meeting, as "topic leader"
  - topic leaders are offered special support to make sure they succeed
  - che team has great flexibility in planning its programme, within a supportive framework
- *carefully designed support*
  - each team has a coach
  - the coaches are trained to support rather than lead the team
- *teams are concentrated in community programmes*
  - the early approach of starting teams "wherever" has been replaced by a strategy of working in selected neighbourhoods

within selected communities, in collaboration with local government and, where appropriate, utilities or business

- each community (or group of smaller communities) has a project manager who is specially trained and coached
- recruiting to teams is concentrated in time and space
- community programmes are planned for 3-5 years

* *win-win solutions* are Grafted by focussing initially on actions which save not only natural resources but also money

Such programmes are now operating in Denmark, Flanders, Finland, Ireland, the Netherlands, Poland, Sweden, Switzerland, the USA, and in a different version in the UK. The basic EcoTeam programme is in operation or development in Iceland, Japan, Korea, Norway, Russia, Slovenia, Spain and Turkey. In addition, the EcoTeam programme is available in Turkish in the Netherlands.

In all these countries and cultures we so far find a common response to the elements of personal action opportunities, multi-level feedback, neighbourhood activities, and membership of a broad, grass-roots movement with positive links with local government and business.

A new type of policy instrument?

When traditional instruments of social governance and the new ecological tools of industry reach their limits, what is there next to use — rhetoric and the persuasive arts, belief systems, emotional appeals? [60 61] Considering the stick and carrot metaphor of social change (alternating pressure and encouragement), in this case we know the sticks, but what are the carrots?

Environmental policy officials of the Netherlands Government and the OECD, with whom we have worked, say that GAP's programmes represent a fourth environmental policy instrument: the first three are carrot, stick, and education; GAP adds empowerment. Over the years, the policy development process has been rather similar to the "social learning" one institution, it has happened within a loosely-knit network of pattners from different organisations and institutions who share a common policy development challenge.

(60) As John Gummer reminds us, "ugovernments have little experience in bringing about the degree of change that is required to attain sustainable development." (Gummer, 1996).

(61) "If we are so concerned about our great appetite for materials, it is plausible to decrease waste, to make better use of stocks available and to develop substitutes. But what about the appetite itself? Surely this is the ultimate source of the problem. Yet in the literature of the resource problem this is the forbidden question. Over it hangs a nearly total silence." (Galbraith, 1958).

(62) "Social learning is about Captive adjustment among a network of participants, who together learn to define arid redefine problems and to co-design and co-implement solutions." It appears to offer potentials that extend beyond other n-*thods,(Meadowcroft, 1997).

The roles of main actors

Here I refer to experience with GAP. The main actors — partners — in GAP's work include ministries of the environment, central and regional planning authorities, sectoral ministries particularly energy and transport ministries, local and regional governments, business and industry, utility companies, universities, consumer organisations and environmental NGOs.

The configurations of working partners vary considerably from country to country. In the Netherlands, the national government has been a principal funder because it recognises GAP's objectives to reduce household consumption align directly with those of its *National Environmental Policy Plan.* Through another department, it has supported the development of Turkish materials. GAP Netherlands has also forged good links with energy authorities and other NGOs. The Danish government contributes to GAP Denmark. In the USA and UK, service partnerships have formed mainly at the municipal, city and county levels. Foundations have been significant funders in the USA and in Poland.

GAP Sweden has forged diverse partnerships, notably with food retail cooperatives, tenants and housing associations and adult education groups. A good deal of its income, and those of GAP in Finland, have derived from consultancies and training courses for the local government sector pursuing local Agenda 21 plans. Business and industry connections have been strongest in the UK and Switzerland. The European Commission has been a co-financing partner for GAP Belgium, Ireland, Netherlands, Russia, and UK. Finally GAP has research partners in several universities.

The single common success factor in these successful partnerships has been a shared agenda for the achievement of results.

Moving forward in support of local initiatives

Removal of obstacles

Respondents to the local government survey on implementation of Local Agenda 21 listed lack of financial support, lack of community consensus to set priorities, lack of support from national governments, and lack of information as their major obstacles [63]. This is common for local initiatives. The National Council for Voluntary Organisations, The Volunteer Centre and the Community Development Foundation in the UK are examples of organisations providing resources and guidance to local groups to assist them through such obstacles. More resources of this kind are needed.

One most welcome form of support is from social actors who offer their name and standing to an initiative and smooth its path. Indeed, it is not so much financial support (always welcome) or the provision of facilities or supplies that may be lacked by local initiatives, but rather a facilitating environment in which to work. Governments could encourage local initiatives by simply removing hindrances and obstacles to citizen action, notably concerning certain legal, fiscal and social security requirements. For example, volunteers and short-term employees could be assisted in ways that do not result in social security penalties.

Research

A broad definition of consumption such as that proposed in the first section of this paper has significant advantages for guiding research and policy development. A research agenda that also addressed the more household-focused questions about the environmental implications of income growth, consumerist ideology, personal values and preferences, and the like, could provide the kinds of knowledge needed to understand and reduce the environmental impacts of consumption in the ECE region.

We would argue chat both action research [64] and participative research at the local level could become powerful components of such an agenda. We strongly recommend that a series of programmes be specifically developed for support by the European Union and other relevant governmental institutions in partnership with citizens' groups to experiment with real-life community potentials and solutions. This could include seeking out, evaluating and supporting existing experiments and projects. The sección provides a broad framework for such research and projects.

Socio-cultural information availability

The importance of geographic and regional factors, particularly their social and cultural aspects, is clearly essential in encouraging local initiatives. Sustainable consumption in one place may have quite a different flavour from another. Initiatives need to take account of their bioregional and socio-cultural characteristics. Communicated examples of pilot projects and success scories ideally should contain this type of information. A very useful project to support would be a directory (online and printed) of local initiatives, with vital information of this sort included.

The public mood

In 1995, the Merck Family Fund commissioned a singular study concerning citizen perspectives on the issue of consumption [65]. The study provides a statistical portrait of how Americans are thinking about a wide range of issues connected to consumption, the environment, and the values and priorities of their society. To the extent that these findings can be generalised for the entire ECE region, five principles emerge for stimulating public interest and involvement in action:

* *Widespread concern :* People share a deep and abiding concern about the core values driving our society; they believe that materialism, greed, and excess characterise the way we live and underlie many of our worst social ills. Citizens are not ready to be lectured on consumption, but they are ready to be engaged. They can be engaged by framing the issue in terms of their fundamental concerns.

* F*uture generations :* Children and future generations are a crucial entry point. Every time children or future generations were men-

(63) International Council for Local Environmental Initiatives, 1977.
(64) For example, Participatory Action Research (PAR) recognises the need for persons being

design and conduct of all phases (e.g. design, execution, dissemination) of the research that affects them. PAR is an approach Of strategy for research not a methodology,
(65)The Harwood Group, 1995.

tioned in the focus groups, interest and engagement in the conversation rose; every time they were mentioned in the survey, huge majorities registered strong views. People are trying, unsuccessfully, to envision a better world for their kids. This issue offers an opportunity to help people create such a vision and to act on it.

- *Longing for balance :* The frenzied, excessive quality of [American] life today has left people yearning for balance in their lives and in our society. They feel that an essential side of life centred on family, friends and community has been pushed aside by the dominant ethic of "more, more, more," and they are looking for ways to restore some equilibrium. A successful public engagement effort will tap this desire for balance.
- *Ambivalence about material goods :* People feel strongly ambivalent about society's preoccupation with material goods. Yet while condemning greed and excess, they admit to a little greed of their own. The third point in this triangle of ambivalence is a strong belief in freedom of choice and an aversion to tell or be told how to live. If people are forced to take sides before they are ready, this ambivalence will lead inevitably to polarised debate and then paralysis. Instead, any public effort must offer people room to explore what they think and what they ate willing to do.
- *Negative view of public discourse :* People associate the public discourse today with acrimony, divisiveness, and gridlock. This issue offers an opportunity to move out of that paradigm by uncovering people's latent sense that a better way is possible. When they hear each other describe common concerns about misplaced values, children, and the environment, and have a chance to explain their longing for a more balanced life, a spark appears — people begin to imagine the possibility of change. Blowing that spark into a significant flame will require demonstrating a sense of movement.

Empowering the context

The public is probably more willing for action to be taken than is thought. One of the most powerful ways to tap public responsiveness on this issue is to bring sustainable consumption unreservedly into the forefront of civic concern. What is important is that potential future consequences of current decisions are more explicitly brought into the public domain[66].

But the discourse should not be just a serious and problem-focused. It should also be engaging, fun, inspirational and inclusive. It should be a stimulus for envisioning a preferred future. The delivery is as important as the message, and the prime role of the message is helping everyone to identify with the situation and discover a role for him or herself in its improvement.

The promotion of more sustainable consumption patterns has to move beyond the alternative media in order to be successful. Ways must be found to turn the skills that are used to shape consumer choices towards environmentally satisfactory options. Fresh collaborations and partners must be sought. The media and "advertising" industries have a large role to play here. Targeting just a few percent of the $450 billion spent annually on advertising worldwide could make a considerable impact, as could contributions of role models.

Public service providers and manufacturers have a significant role in making available appropriate technological and consumer alternatives, removing current limitations where necessary so that consumers are free to choose in the marketplace from the widest range of options. So have the employment and welfare sectors that may be contributing to people feeling trapped and having no real options to move, i.e., paradoxically experiencing little or no choice in a society where choices apparently abound.

In all sectors, consumption needs to be "reimaged"[67]. The desired outcome should be a feeling of relief ("Whew! That's over." "Glad I don't have to play that one any longer") and possibility ("Now I/we can ..." "What if ..."). Governments and all social leaders have a significant role to play in the public "conferral of rights" to participate and a reciprocal "conferral of responsibility" — that this is important and matters to everyone.

(66) James Meadowcroft, 1997.
(67) An example: Industrial Ecology III, the third annual roundtable of the Future 500, will explore how businesses are learning to prosper like nature: by design, not consumption. By the design of a microchip, a fuel cell, a creative team, not the consumption of a ton of paper a barrel of oil, an overstretched workforce,"

A social project

There is a science fiction novel called *The Gameplayers of Zan.* Knowing that its future survival rests in mass-migration to another planet, a population has devoted itself over cens of generations to the construction of a spaceship capable of the journey. The project is so complex that the entire fabric of the society, its social structure and governance, its customs and myths, has evolved to serve chis goal. The transit vessel is largely complete in a huge underground cavern. The main challenge now lies in the fact that the ship is already moving at exit speed. It is the sole task of two of the clans to maintain the ship in a stationary position during the last stages of fitting, which may yet take some decades. They do this by playing a highly strategic "game" against each other, with selected individuals from each clan to taking turn around the clock, day and night. These are che "gameplayers". One wrong play and the movement of the ship would cause a catastrophe. The other clans contribute to che upkeep of the gameplayers, each wich their own trade or craft, as well as ensuring che society functions in all the usual ways.

This story conveys the power of a collective project fundamental to the survival of a society — a project so large chat no one person can comprehend it all, that requires the cooperation of everyone, specialised skills and roles, a long-sighted vision, and an ever present sense of risk tempered by the shared awareness of a common goal.

What if it was agreed that the challenge of developing sustainability is the greatest challenge ever faced by humankind? The vision of such a project could capture che collective imagination — as getting to the moon did in the 1950s and 60s. It is a paradox that humanity's immense propensity for culture, in all its forms, and of which technology is a tangible manifestation and make economic development possible, is the basic reason why we can impact so heavily on our environment [68]. What if, instead of defining ourselves as isolated players pursuing limited goals and effecting change at the margins only, we were to develop a richer central project — one chat was synergistic, soulful, and sustainable.

Meadowcroft comments that "[t]here is no doubt chat sustainable development is a complex and ambitious social objective [S]ustainable development is best thought of as .... a long-term social 'meta-objective' ... It is both the result chat ensues when genuine development stays within the frontiers of environmental prudence, and a demanding normative standard which requires the balancing of environment, economic activity and social equity in current decision-making. Thus sustainable development is 'open ended' ... [E]ach generation must take up the challenge anew, determining in what directions lie their development objectives; what constitutes the boundaries of the environmentally possible and the environmentally desirable; and what is their understanding of the requirements of social justice." [69]

Obstacles and bogies

As with any difficult undertaking, reasons why it might be on the wrong course abound. This is a brief presentation of some of the main objections to strengthening a "non-traditional" approach to reducing consumption, and some responses.

We *are making substantial progress:* No, everywhere consumption is rising [70]; we are recycling more than ever and consuming more than ever [71].

We *cannot proceed without more research!sustainable consumption must be defined:* In our experience, of all the resistances to taking action on sustainable consumption, lack of adequate definition of the issues has never been one. When the need for more knowledge is used as a reason for inaction, there are invariably other reasons.

There are more important priorities: There are certainly other things to do, but there is greater consensus on sustainable development and consumption than any other global strategy".

Leave it to the market: The market was never designed to deal with equity or environmental quality, nor can it deliver socially just outcomes or provide environmental protection. Market efficiency does not mean sustainable consumption.

(68) Dovers and Handmer, undated.
(69) Meadowcroft, 1997.
(70) Rio+5 International Secretariat, 1997.
(71) Nina Rao, 1997, *The Oxy-*

The *ZPG* Reporter, March/April 1997,
http://www.zpg.org/FACTSHET/oxymoron.htm
(72) Elkins, 1994.

Industry efficiencies are adequate: 1. Too risky. If consumption of material goods and material intensive services rises, the efficiency gains in production may be eaten up. Any efficiency strategy must be accompanied by a complementary strategy of sufficiency. 2. Ecoefficiency and industrial ecology are based on two of the three pillars of sustainable development (economy and ecology). Society is left out. 3- "Designing for sustainability" has yet to demonstrate a broad appeal [73].

Use economic instruments to reverse trends: A useful tool amongst others, but better to start with the removal of economic instruments that distort economic activity in favour of environmental degradation [74].

There is nothing wrong with consuming in order to meet our needs: "The basic needs of all present people take priority over future numbers, but the existence of more future people takes priority over the trivial wants of the present" (Herman Daly).

Sellers only satisfy buyer's wants: Sellers want buyers to believe they'll be/are better off with the product or service, regardless of wants and needs. They work hard to create and reinforce the belief. The stronger the belief, the more likely the buyer will express satisfaction and come back.

We can continue to consume more, just more efficiently: 1. "Any scenario for sustainable consumption includes the assumption that citizens of the developed countries will consume less, and in many cases far less, resources per capita." (International Organization of Consumers Unions (IOCU)) [75]. 2. Overall growth in consumption of goods and services is simply not possible in any material sense; sustainable consumption, for the most part, must imply a decrease in consumption [76]. 3. If humans fail to stop growth in the rates of consumption of resources, nature will step in. Nature's method of stopping growth is cruel and inhumane (Bartlett's fourteenth law) [77].

The limits to growth have been discredited: We don't need to know earth's limits as long as we know and follow her rules [78].

A growth in consumption is necessary to secure full employment: If we have a setup which will not permit everyone to take part in work and its fruits except at the price of ever-increasing over-consumption, then there is something wrong with the set-up, not with the level of consumption [79].

Constraining consumption in the North will not help the South[80]; Nor necessarily will increasing consumption help. The effects are indirect. If the North wants to help the South it can find mote direct means.

National security is more important: As long as we use this as an excuse we breach the type of global civic ethic advocated by the Commission on Global Governance [81], and risk jeopardising global security and bringing even graver consequences.

Opportunities

We would suggest there are a considerable number of opportunities available for active support, many amenable to local initiative. The examples mentioned below indicate the scope and possibilities. We feel strongly, however, that any programmes, publicly funded or otherwise, should have the early design input of people who are likely to be stakeholders and potential participants.

A possible agenda for research

Aside from the visioning and awareness raising aspects, there is no shortage of areas containing promising strategies to pursue within this framework of a social project. The following list suggests some of the environmentally important social phenomena that tend to be overlooked under the narrow, popular definition of consumption and hold potential for local initiative. Research questions and points for debate are added [82].

Changes in the structure of production and work: Consumption can decrease without change in households' preferences, incomes, or wellbeing if products are manufactured in less environmentally destructive ways; also if working conditions put less stress on the environment (e.g., telecommuting). What trends move the economy in these directions, particularly local economies? Which structural changes are beneficial for local level implementation? What

(75) Toni Armstrong, 1997.
(74) Such as the Common Agricultural Policy of the European Community, the damaging effects of the European Regional Development Fund, and the presence of massive energy and water subsidies the world over. (Pearce, 1994).
(75) Cited in 0ivind Fjeldstad, undated.
(76) Jernalöv and Jernalöv, undated.
(77) Banlett, undated.
(78) These are laws of the socio/ecological economy proposed by The Natural Step: 1.

widistand a systematic build-up

by humans (e.g., PCBs); 3. Natural resources cannot be systematically harvested more than nature's capacity for renewal; 4.

three system conditions, we need a just and efficient economy.

information, of which one is Scott, 1996
(79)Hille,1995.
(80) Pearce, 1994.
(81) "The changes of the last half-century have brought the global neighbourhood nearer to reality - a world in which citizens are increasingly dependent

erate. Matters calling for global neighbourhood action keep multiplying. What happens far

"We believe that a global civic ethic to guide action within the global neighbourhood and leadership infused with that ethic are vital to the quality of global govemance. We call for a common commitment to core values that all humanity could uphold: respect for life, liberty, justice and equality, mutual respect, caring and integrity. We further believe that humanity as a whole will be best served by recognised responsibilities.
"It should encompass the right of all people to: a secure life; equitable treatment; an opportunity to earn a fair living and provide for their own welfare; the definition and preservation of their differences through peaceful means; participation in governance at all levels; free and fair petition for redress of gross injustices; equal access to infor-

policies promote or hinder these changes?

Substitution of services for products: Many consumer purchases are motivated by desire for a service or function. People buy natural gas for heating but could get this as well from passive solar housing design; they buy automobiles to travel, but might préfet a well-designed mass transit system. What drives such trends? What local factors are influential? People also substitute restaurant food for home cooking; what are the environment implications?

Changes in household composition and pattern of life: Recent socio-demographic trends, such as the ageing of the population and increasing labour force participation among women of childbearing ages, have significant environmental implications. They affect demand for travel, space conditioning, and various other consumer services independently of any change in basic values or attitudes about the environment. How do changing lifestyle and working patterns affect consumption? What is the role of local factors in lifestyle choices?

Changing purchasing power: Most indications are that people have an enormous compulsion to find a need for available resources. For every extra unit of purchasing power, the level of consumption tilts towards luxury goods and services, most notably air and car travel [83]. As long as there is an increase in purchasing power it is difficult to make people abstain from what they want, particularly if comparable income groups already have it [84]. What factors can influence voluntary abstinence from consumption? What causes people to stabilise or reduce their purchasing power? How important are local factors? How useful is the levelling of wage differences? How would people spend their money if they become more affluent?

Exploring sufficiency: When is enough enough, and why does this vary between people and situations? What does sufficiency feel like? Where/what is the experience? Are there more direct satisfiers? What happens in the transition from material to psychological comfort/ well being? What external cycles embody sustainability and how do people internalise such cycles? What is the role of family, neighbours, friends and local community?

Determinants of consumer behaviour. Most of the research capturing the consumption-environment interrelation is within disciplines (psychology, sociology, biology, economics, consumer research and marketing, anthropology) [85]. Little cross-disciplinary work has been done. Much remains in understanding why consumers behave the ways they do. For example, what is the pattern of imitative behaviour? To what degree are purchases social signals? Does education influence consumer behaviour? What roles have social status, family size, gender, age?

A preliminary list of local actions

Broad priorities for local action on sustainable consumption:

- Reducing the level (quantity, rate) of consumption first, or in combination with;
- Changing the pattern of consumption [S6];
- Reorienting the role of consumption in lifestyle;
- Providing substitute goods and services (especially non-material alternatives) ;
- Improving efficiency of resource use;
- Waste avoidance;
- Identifying, tightening and restoring ecocycles in consumption processes.

Local projects and initiatives - a very preliminary listing

- Creating commercially viable local sustainable projects: community car pools, bulk foodshops, appliance repair,...;
- Designing and manufacturing redesigned substitute products and services [S7];
- Facilitate creation of local stakeholder groups for land use and transport planning (for policy and programme development, in the same way as local school and hospital boards act in many countries);
- Investigating more efficient use of community services and infrastructure;
- Collaborating with local businesses (particularly foreign companies) to build business-community relationships based on trust and co-dependence. First step for a business is development and adoption of social and environmental audits of operations;

mation; and equal access to the global commons.
"At the same cime ..., all people share a responsibility to: contribute to the common good; consider the impact of their actions on the security and welfare of others; promote equity; protect the interests of future generations by pursuing sustainable development and safeguarding the global commons; preserve humanity's cultural and intellectual heritage; be active

(The Commission on Global Governance, 1995).

(S2) Adapted from Paul Stern, 1995.

(S3) As noted above, increasing transport disrances is perhaps

of environmental impact of the past two to three decades and the

time yet as the global marketplace evolves. This is not just as a result of trade expansion and liberalisation. It includes personalised travel for business and trade, global governance, tourism. The impact of increased travel of people and goods has been so marked that it has been suggested that in the

sumption, there should be a system of global taxation on servicing the needs of the global economy: coordinating the flight lanes and sea lanes.
In Norway, for example, transport has shown by far the strongest growth in consumption by sector over the past generation, despite the fact that the relative price of air transport has dropped markedly, so that it has been possible to accommodate a 30-foid increase in air travel without its making up more than a couple of percent of private consumption in 1989/91. In 1994, car sales were back to early 1970's levels and air travel had literally taken off (up *12%* on 1993 in the first three-quarters). The share of rail and bus trans the other had, has fallen markedly. This reflects a complete stagnumber of passenger-kilometres

m 1990 as in 1960). (Hille, 1995,Chapter 4.)

(84)Traasdahl, 1994.

(85) de Bruyn, Vellinga and Heintz (ed.), 1997.

(86) Bank. 1994.

• Joint initiatives with retailers [88] and producers (local farmers, foresters, etc);
• Demonstration /education projects of concepts of environmental space, ecological rucksacks;
• Other ways show what sustainable consumption might mean — really good games, media programmes, visitor centres, etc;
• Reframing/reimaging local projects: e.g. 'low-growth and no-growth" communities; a housing development that amortized its costs over 20 years at the equivalent rates of environmental space; a business which grew its profits by growing its workforce and decreasing resource use;
• Redeveloping (derelict building sites, buildings, transport links) rather than developing anew on "greenfields";
• Developing sustainable communities and ecovillages [89];
• Harnessing/mobilising consumer power [90 91], e.g. to change local shopping choices;
• Undertaking consumer research and information campaigns;
• Publish action alerts and sustain local campaigns to obtain environmentally sound products and production. When needed, local boycotts and banning of environmentally harmful products and production;
• Creating local/regional service bureau for advice and resources [92];
• Clubs and support groups for less-resource intensive gardening, eating ...;
• Raising awareness/campaigning on the import of advertising and other commercial messages [93 94];
• Developing local cooperatives, savings and ethical investment schemes;
• Developing future sustainability scenarios;
• Facilitating the above as a provider of skills in group dynamics and consensus building;
• Facilitating the above as consultant, financier, sponsor ...;
• Monitoring and reporting the above [95 96].

References

Abraham, Martin (undated). "ASEAN Environment Programme", cited in 0ivind Fjeldstad , A *Fair Share: "Environmental Space" As a Tool for Changing Consumption Patterm.* The Norwegian Forum for Environment and Development Forum/ Forum for utvikling og miljo (ForUM), Oslo. http://www.pandora.ca/linkages/consume/fjeld.html

AdBusters homepage.
http://www.adbuscers.org/adbusrers/Pop/index.hrrnl

Alternatieve Konsurnenten Bond (Alternative Consumer Association) homepage
http://www.pz.nl/akb/engels.htm

Armstrong, Tom (1997). *Design for Sustainability.* Background paper for Environment Canada's workshop on *Sustainable Consumption and Production* (25-27 May 1997, Ottawa). IndEco Strategic Consulting Inc., Toronto, Canada.
http://www.indeco.com/prj_scap.htm

Bank, Hélène (1994). *Everyday Environmental Protection Thinking Globally - Acting Locally.* The Norwegian Society for the Conservation of Nature, Friends of the Earth - Norges Naturvernforbund (NNV)
http://www.af.nfr.no/af/af-pub/rapp94-02/kap-02.html

Bartlett, Albert (undated). *Laws, Hypotheses, Observations And Predictions Relating To Sustainability.*
http://dieoff.org/page39.htm

Böge, Stefanie (1993). *Road Transport of Goods and the Effects on the Spatial Environment.* Wupperral Institute for Cimate, Environment and Energy, Wuppertal, Germany.

Catton, W (1986). *Carrying capacity and the limits to freedom.* Paper prepared for Social Ecology Session 1, XI World Congress of Sociology, New Delhi, India.

Commission on Global Governance (1995). *A Call to Action: Summary of Our Global Neighbourhood.* Commission on Global Governance, Geneva.

de Bruyn, Sander, Pier Vellinga and Roebijn Heintz, eds. (1997). *The International Human Dimensions Programme on Industrial Transformation (IHDP-IT). Industrial Transformation: An Inventory of Research.* RMNO and IVM/SENSE, Amsterdam, Netherlands, http://ohrid.cca.vu.nl/english/o_o/instituten/IVM/projects/research/ihdp-it/hdprep/fb_chap5.htm

Dovers, Stephen R and John W Handmer (undated). *Contradictions in Sustainability.* Centre for Resource and Environmental Studies, Australian National University (ANU), Canberra, Australia.

(87) Armstrong, 1997.
(88) WBCSD Working Group on Sustainable Production and Consumption, 1997.
(89) Global Ecovillage Network, 1998.
(90) Andy Roberts, 1997.
(91) For example, Alternatieve Konsumenten Bond
(92) For example, Dag Endal, 1994.
(93) Maria Elena Hurtado, 1997.
(9*4)* For example, AdBusters.
(95) For example. European Academy of the Urban Environnant, 1996.
(96) For example, Lafferty (comp.), 1994.

Edelkoort, Lidewij (1996). *Rapport Trendanalyse Consumptie en Milieu. A* scudy performed by order of the Ministry of Housing, Spatial Planning and Environment (VROM), Netherlands. See also IVAM Environmental Research, 1996, *Milieubeleid van onderaf bezien, enn handleiding voor beleidmakers*, VROM, for cultural insights into success factors initiating behavioural change in lifestyles.

Elkins, Paul (1994). "Unsustainability: A Consensus". In: *Toward Sustainable Development: Concepts, Methods, And Policy*, edited by Jeroen C.J.M. van den Bergh and Jan van der Straaten, The International Society for Ecological Economics and Island Press. http://dieoff.org/page10.htm

Endal, Dag (1994). *Citizen Mobilization for Environmental Protection and Sustainable Consumption*. The Environmental Home Guard/Miljoheimevecnet, Oslo, Norway. http://www.af.nfr.no/af/af-pub/rapp94-02/kap-04.html

Ehrlich, Paul (1994). *Too Many Rice People: Weighing Relative Burdens on the Planet*. Paper presented at the International Conference On Population And Development (5-13 September 1994, Cairo).

European Academy of the Urban Environment, 1996, *SURBAN, the database on sustainable urban development in Europe*. http://www.eaue.de/winuwd/list.htm

Friends of the Earth Netherlands (1990). *Action Plan for a Sustainable Netherlands*. Vereniging Milieudefense, Amsterdam.

Friends of the Earth Scotland, http://www.foe-scotland.org.uk/campaigns/sustainabie-scot/env-space/index.html

Galbraith, John Kenneth (1958). *The Affluent Society*. Hughton Mifflin, Boscon.

Gardner, Gerald T and Paul C. Stern (1990). *Environmental Problems and Human Behaviour*. Allyn & Gardner

Gershon, David and Gail Sträub (1991). *Empowerment: the art of creating your life as you want it*. Delta, USA.

Global Ecovillage Network (1997). Eco-Village Audits: How Ecologically, Socially, Culturally Sustainable is Your Community? http://www.gaia.org/thegen/evaudic/index.html

Gummer, John (1996). "Valuing the Environment". In: *Oar Planet*, Vol. 8.2, August 1996, UNEP. http://www.ourplanet.com/imgversn/82/gummer.html

Hareide, Dag (1996). *Det GodeNorge*. Norwegian Society for Conservation of Nature, Oslo.

Harwood Group, The, 1995, *Yearning for Balance: views of Americans on consumption, materialism and the environment*. Merck Family Fund, Takoma Park, MD & National Research Council, USA

http://www.newdream.org/yearning/yearn_full.html

Hule, John (1995). *Sustainable Norway*. ProSus, Oslo, Norway. http://www.af.nfr.no/af/af-pub/sustainablc/f

Hurtado, María Elena (1997). *Creating Artificial Needs: How Advertising Drives Consumption*. Consumers International. http://www.consumersinternational.org/rights-day97/chapter3/creating.htm

International Council for Local Environmental Initiatives, 1997, *Local Agenda 21 Survey: A Study of Responses by Local Authorities and Their National and International Associations to Agenda 21*. ICLEI in cooperation with United Nations Department for Policy Coordination and Sustainable Development. http://cities21.com/la21 /la21rep.htm

International Institute of Sustainable Development (undated). *Instruments for Change: Making Production and Consumption More Sustainable*. http://iisd.ca/susprod/

Jernalöv, Arne and Simon Jernalöv (undated). *Sustainable Development and Sustainable Consumption*. Linkages Virtual Policy Dialogue, Sustainable Consumption & Production, http://www.pandora.ca/linkages/consume/inst-sd.html

Kanatschnig, D, H Retzl and L Schmidt (1997). *Local Initiatives in Austria towards Sustainable Consumption Patterns: purchase of consumer goods and related ser-vices*. National review submitted by the Federal Ministry for Environment, Youth and Family, Austria, to the *Workshop of Encouraging Local Initiatives towards Sustainable Consumption Patterns* (2-4 February 199S, Vienna), Economic Commission for Europe (ECE).

Lafferty, William M (1994). *Research and Information for Alternative Patterns of Production and Consumption*. Project for an. Alternative Future/Prosjekt Alternativ Framtid, Oslo, Norway.

Lafferty, William M, comp. (1994), *Steps Towards Sustainable Consumption - A présentation of selected Norwegian initiatives*. ProSus Norway, http://www.af.nfr.no/af/af-pub/rapp94-02/innhold.html

Lafferty, William M and Katarina Eckerberg, eds. (1997). *Front Earth Summit to Local Forum: Studies of Local Agenda 21 in Europe*. ProSus, Norway.

McKibben, Bill (1998). *A Special Moment in History*. In: *The Atlantic Monthly*, May 1998.

McNeill, Desmond (1994). *The Need for Holistic Theory in Research for Sustainable Consumption*. Centre fot Development and the Environment/Senter for utvikling og miljö (SUM), University of Oslo, Norway.

Meadowcroft, James (1997). *Democratic Planning and the Challenge of Sustainable Development*. ProSus Report 1/97, ProSus, Oslo Norway. http://www.af.nfr.no/pub-likasjoner/forskningsrapporter/1997-01/97-01-txt.html.#3.4

Mehlmann, Marilyn (1995). *Notes from a research meeting.* Stockholm, ubpubl.

Ofstad, Sylvi, ed. (1994). *Symposium: Sustainable Consumption.* Oslo, Miljřverndepartemenret. Report of Symposium (19-20 January 1994, Oslo, Norway).

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, 1995. The Rosendal Workshop *Sustainable Consumption and Production: Clarifying the Concepts,* (2-4 July 1995, Rosendal, Norway). OECD, Paris.

Pearce, David (1994). " Sustainable Consumption through Economic Instruments". Paper prepared for che Government of Norway, *Symposium on Sustainable Consumption* (19-20 January 1994, Oslo). Centre for Social and Economic Research on the Global Environment, University College London, UK. http://www.iisd.ca/linkages/consume/pearce.html

Rao, Nina (1997). *The Oxymoron of Sustainable Consumption.* The ZPG Reporter, March/April 1997, http://www.zpg.org/FACTSHET/oxymoron.htm

Rees, William E (1996). "Revisiting Carrying Capacity: Area-Based Indicators of Sustainability". In: *Population and Environment: Ajournai of Interdisciplinary Studies* Vol. 17, No. 3, January 1996. http://www.dieoff.org/page110.htm

Rio+5 International Secretariat, 1997, *Moving Sustainable Development from Agenda to Action.* The Earth Council, San José, Cosca Rica, http://www.ecouncil.ac.cr/no/preforum.htm

Roberts, Andy (1997). *Harnessing Consumer Power: What Can Consumers Do to Make a Difference?* and *Consumer Action for People and the Environment* http://www.consumersinternational.org/rightsday97/chapter6/appendix.htrn. Consumers International.

Rocky Mountain Institute, 1977, *Economic Renewal: Fostering, sustainability at the community level.* Rocky Mountain Institute, Snowmass, CO, USA.

Rogers, Everett M (19S3). *Diffusion of Innovations.* Free Press, New York, third ed.

Rushmoor Borough Council (1994). *What is a Sustainable community?* http://www.rushmoor.gov.uk/gr9l4.htm

Schroeder, Steven A (1992). *Future Perspectives For Foundation Philanthropy.* The Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, Princeton, NJ, USA. http://www.rwjf.org/library/reflect6.htm

Scott, Mary (1996) *The Natural Step: Sweden's commonsense green scheme comes lo America.* First published in *The Utne Reader.* http://www.intercall.com/~rcmetz/features/arcramp/natscep.htm

Shiva, Vandana (1996). "Values Beyond Price". *Our Planet:* 8.2, August 1996, UNEP. http://www.ourplanet.com/imgversn/82/shiva.html

Spangenberg, Joachim H (1995). *Towards Sustainable Europe.* Wuppertal Institute for Climate, Environment and Energy, Germany.

Staats, H J and P Harland (1995). *The EcoTeam Program in the Netherlands. Study 4: A longitudinal study on the effects of the EcoTeam Program on environmental behaviour and its psychological backgrounds.* Faculty of Social and Behavioural Sciences, Centre for Energy and Environmental Research, Leiden University, Leiden, Netherlands,

Stern, Paul C (1995). *Towards a Working Definition of Consumption for Environmental Research and Policy - DRAFT.* National Research Council of Canada. http://www.pandora.ca/linkages/consume/stern.html

Sylvan, Louise (1997). *Sustainable Development And The Consumer Movement.* Paper presented at the International Conference on Consumer Protection, *Consumers in the Global Age.* (22 - 24 January 1997, New Delhi). Aus-Italian Consumers Association. http://www.sofcom.com.au/ACA/Speeches/Louise.html

Theobald, Robert (1998). *Robert Theobald Home Page, Transformational Learning Community.* http://www.transforrn.org/transform/tlc/rtpage.html

The Natural Step. http://www.intercall.com/~remetz/feacures/arcramp/natstep.htm

Traasdahl, Tor (1994). *Homo Consumens - Man as Consumer.* The Future in Our Hands/Framtiden i vare hender (FIVH), http://www.af.nfr.no/af/af-pub/rapp94-02/kap-03.html

Wackernagel, Machis and William Rees (1996), *Our Ecological Footprint: reducing human impact on the Earth.* New Society Publishers, Philadelphia, PA, USA.

WBCSD Working Group on Sustainable Production and Consumption (1997). 20/20; *A Vision for the Environment. The Role of the Retailer in Sustainable Production and Consumption.*, Geneva. http://ww.wbcsd.ch/FocusAreas/spc/retailpaperforLD.html

van Brakel, Manus and Maria Buitenkamp (1993). *Oar Fair Share.* Originally published in: In *Context* #36, Fall 1993.

World Commission on Environment and Development, 1987. *Our Common Future* also known as the *Brundtland Report,* Oxford University Press.

Wuppertal Institute for Climate, Environment and Energy, 1995, *Sustainable Germany: A Contribution to Sustainable Global Development.* Study prepared on behalf of BUND and Misereor.

Wuppertal Institute for Climate, Environment and Energy, 1997, *Annual Report 199611997.* http://www.wupperinsc.org/WI/Jahrbuch_e/annual_report.html

Vers une évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université

*par Basarab Nicolescu **

Le texte que nous publions ci-après est le document de synthèse, rédigé par Basarad Nicolescu, du projet *Évo-¡iiĩion transdisciplinaire de l'université* élaboré par le Centre international de recherches et d'études transdisciplinaires (CIRET) en collaboration avec l'Unesco '- Ce projet a été présenté comme document de travail au congrès international *Quelle université pour demain ? Vers une évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université* (Locarno, Suisse, 30 avril - 2 mai 1997), parrainé par l'Unesco et le gouvernement du Tessin et organisé par le CIRET en collaboration avec l'Association international pour la vidéo dans les arts et la culture (AIVAC).

Pendant toute sa durée d'élaboration le projet a été piloté par Madeleine Gobeil, directeur de la division des Arts et de la vie culturelle de l'Unesco (actuellement consultante auprès du directeur général de l'Unesco} et par Basarab Nicolescu, président du CIRET. Dans la première phase de l'élaboration du projet (octobre 1995 - septembre 1996) un groupe de pilotage a été formé dont la composition était la suivante :
Coordonnateurs : Madeleine Gobeil (Unesco), Basarab Nicolescu (CIRET) ; Membres : René Berger, professeur honoraire à l'université de Lausanne, président d'honneur de l'Association internationale des critiques d'art et de l'AIVAC ; André Bourguignon, professeur honoraire de psychiatrie à la faculté de Médecine de Créteil, co-directeur de la publication des œuvres complètes de Freud en français ; Michel Camus, vice-président du Comité d'initiative de l'Institut international pour l'opéra et la poésie de Vérone, écrivain, philosophe, directeur des Éditions "Lettres Vives", producteur-délégué a France-Culture ; Ubiratan D'Ambrosio, mathématicien, professeur emèrite à l'université de Campinas, membre de l'Académie des sciences de Sao Paulo ; Giuseppe Del Re, chimiste théoricien et épistémologue, professeur à l'université de Naples ; Marco Antonio Dias, directeur de la division d'Éducation supérieure de l'Unesco; Pablo Gonzalez Casanova, ancien recteur de l'université nationale autonome du Mexique, directeur du Centre d'études des sciences humaines ; Pierre Karli, neurobiologiste des comportements, professeur emèrite à l'université de Strasbourg, membre de l'Académie des sciences; Jacques Lafait, physicien, directeur de recherche au CNRS, université Pierre et Marie Curie, Paris ; Christine Maillard, germaniste, professeur à l'université des sciences humaines de Strasbourg ; Abdelwahab Meddeb, écrivain tunisien, professeur à l'université de Nantetre, directeur de la revue *Dédale* ; Edgar Morin, philosophe et sociologue, directeur de recherche au CNRS ; René Passet, économiste, professeur à l'université Paris I (Pantheon-Sorbonne) ; Philippe Quéau, directeur de la division de l'Information et de l'informatique de l'Unesco ; Andreù Solé, spécialiste en management, professeur au Groupe hautes études commerciales (HEC).

Toujours dans la première phase de l'élaboration du projet, une journée d'étude ayant comme thème principal l'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université a été organisée par le CIRET à l'Unesco le 29 mars 1996.

Finalité

Dans l'élaboration du projet, le CIRET a eu comme souci principal d'éviter tout double emploi par rapport à la multitude, existante ou à venir, de projets, congrès et colloques sur l'éducation, en affirmant son originalité : *faire pénétrer la pensée complexe et transdisciplinaire dans les structures, les programmes et le rayonnement de l'université de demain.* Ce projet se positionne ainsi comme *le complément transdisciplinaire* du *Rapport Delors,* élaboré par la Commission internationale sur l'éducation pour le vingt et unième siècle auprès de l'Unesco. Le projet sera présenté, sous une forme ou une autre, à la Conférence mondiale sur l'enseignement supérieur de 1998, organisée à l'initiative de l'Unesco.

L'objectif à long terme du projet CIRET-Unesco est de faire évoluer l'université vers sa mission oubliée aujourd'hui - *l'étude de l'universel*, dans notre monde caractérisé par une complexité sans cesse croissante. La pensée éclatée est incompatible avec la recherche de la paix sur cette terre. L'idée centrale du projet est *qu´il y a une relation directe et incontournable entre paix et transdisciplinarité.*

L'objectif à court terme du projet CIRET-Unesco est de *convaincre quelques présidents d universités dans le monde d'appliquer nos propositions à titre expérimental*, en considérant l'université non seulement comme un Heu d'apprentissage de connaissances mais aussi comme un lieu de culture, d'art, de spiritualité et de vie. Dans ce sens, le projet u volontairement une démande *expérimentale.* Dans le même esprit, nous avons

* Président du Centre international de recherches et études transdisciplinaires (CIRET)
(1) Contrat inserir dans le programme 28 C5 de l'UNESCO.

Transnational Associations, 3/1998.148-159.

l'intention de proposer ce projet aux décideurs du monde entier dans les différents domaines - éducatif, politique, économique, scientifique, artistique, religieux et social, sous la forme d'un livre, élaboré après le congrès de Locarno.

Pluridisciplinarité, interdisciplinarité et transdisciplinarité

La croissance sans précédent des savoirs à notre époque rend légitime la question de l'adaptation des mentalités à ces savoirs. L'enjeu est de taille car l'extension continue de la civilisation de type occidental à l'échelle planétaire rendrait sa chute équivalente à un incendie planétaire sans commune mesure avec les deux premières guerres mondiales.

L'harmonie entre les mentalités et les savoirs présuppose que ces savoirs soient intelligibles, compréhensibles. Mais une compréhension peut-elle encore exister à l'ère du big bang disciplinaire et de la spécialisation à outrance ?

Un Pic de la Mirandole à notre époque esc inconcevable. Deux spécialistes de la même discipline ont aujourd'hui du mal à comprendre leurs propres résultats réciproques. Cela n'a rien de monstrueux dans la mesure où c'est l'intelligence collective de la communauté attachée à cette discipline qui la fait progresser, et non pas un seul cerveau qui devrait forcement connaître tous les résultats de tous ses collègues-cerveaux, ce qui est impossible. Car il y a aujourd'hui des centaines de disciplines. Comment un physicien théoricien des particules pourrait-il vraiment dialoguer avec un neurophysiologiste, un mathématicien avec un poète, un biologiste avec un économiste, un politicien avec un informaticien, au delà de généralités plus ou moins banales ? Et pourtant un véritable décideur devrait pouvoir dialoguer avec tous à la fois. Le langage disciplinaire est un barrage apparemment infranchissable pour un néophyte. Et nous sommes tous les néophytes des autres. La Tour de Babel serait-elle inévitable ?

Ce processus de babélisation ne peut pas continuer sans mettre en danger notre propre existence, car il signifie qu'un décideur devient, malgré lui, de plus en plus incompétent. Les défis majeurs de notre époque, comme par exemple les défis d'ordre éthique, réclament de plus en plus de compétences. Mais la somme des meilleurs spécialistes dans leur domaine ne peut engendrer, de toute évidence, qu'une incompétence généralisée, car la somme des compétences n'est pas la compétence : sur le plan technique, l'intersection entre les différents domaines du savoir est un ensemble vide. Or, qu'est-ce qu'un décideur, individuel ou collectif, sinon celui qui est capable de prendre en compte toutes les données du problème qu'il examine ?

Le besoin indispensable de *liens* entre les différentes disciplines s'est traduit par l'émergence, vers le milieu du XXème siècle, de la pluridisciplinarité et de l'interdisciplinarité.

La pluridisciplinarité concerne l'étude d'un objet d'une seule et même discipline par plusieurs disciplines à la fois. Par exemple, un tableau de Giotto peut être étudié par le regard de l'histoire de l'art croisé avec celui de la physique, la chimie, l'histoire des religions, l'histoire de l'Europe et la géométrie. Ou bien, la philosophie marxiste peut être étudiée par le regard croisé de la philosophie avec la physique, l'économie, la psychanalyse ou la littérature. L'objet en question sortira ainsi enrichi du croisement de plusieurs disciplines. La connaissance de l'objet dans sa propre discipline est approfondie par un apport pluridisciplinaire fécond. La recherche pluridisciplinaire apporte un plus à la discipline en question (l'histoire de l'art ou la philosophie, dans nos exemples), mais ce "plus" esc au service exclusif de cette même discipline. Autrement dît, la démarche pluridisciplinaire déborde les disciplines mais *sa finalité reste inscrite dans le cadre de la recherche disciplinaire.*

L'interdisciplinarité a une ambition différente de celle de la pluridisciplinarité. *Elle concerne le transfert des méthodes d'une discipline à l'antre.* On peut distinguer trois degrés de l'interdisciplinarité :

a) *un degré d'application.* Par exemple, les méthodes de la physique nucléaire transférées à la médecine conduisent à l'apparition de nouveaux traitements du cancer ;

b) *un degré épistémologique.* Par exemple, le transfert des méthodes de la logique formelle dans le domaine du droit génère des analyses intéressantes dans l'epistemologie du droit ; c) *un degré d'engendreinent de nouvelles disciplines.* Par exemple, le transfett des méthodes de la mathématique dans le domaine de la physique a engendré la physique mathématique, de la physique des particules à l'astrophysique - la cosmologie quantique, de la mathématique aux phénomènes météorologiques ou ceux de la bourse - la théorie du chaos, de l'informatique dans l'art - l'art informatique. Comme la pluridisciplinarité, l'interdisciplinarité déborde les disciplines mais *sa finalité reste aussi inscrite dans la recherche disciplinaire.* Par son troisième degré, l'interdisciplinarité contribue même au big bang disciplinaire.

La transdisciplinarité concerne, comme le préfixe "trans" l'indique, ce qui est à la fois *entre* les disciplines, *à travers* les différentes disciplines et *au delà* de toute discipline. Sa finalité est la *compréhension du monde présent,* dont un des impératifs est l'unité de la connaissance.

Y a-t-il quelque chose entre et à travers les disciplines et au delà de toute discipline ? Du point de vue de la pensée classique il n'y a rien, strictement rien. L'espace en question est vide, complètement vide, comme le vide de la physique classique. Même si elle renonce à la vision pyramidale de la connaissance, la pensée classique considère que chaque fragment de la pyramide, engendré par le big bang disciplinaire, est une pyramide entière ; chaque discipline clame que le champ de sa pertinence est inépuisable. Pour la pensée classique, la transdisciplinarité est une absurdité car elle n'a pas d'objet. En revanche pour la transdisciplinarité, la pensée classique n'est pas absurde mais son champ d'application est reconnu comme étant restreint.

En présence de plusieurs niveaux de réalité, l'espace entre les disciplines et au delà des disciplines est plein, comme le vide quantique est plein de toutes les potentialités : de la particule quantique aux galaxies, du quark aux éléments lourds qui conditionnent l'apparition de la vie dans l'univers.

Les trois piliers de la transdisciplinarité - *les niveaux de réalité, la logique du tiers inclus et la complexité* - déterminent *la méthodologie de la recherche transdisciplinaire.*

La structure discontinue des niveaux de Réalité détermine *la structure discontinue de l'espace transdisciplinaire,* qui, à son tour, explique pourquoi la recherche transdisciplinaire est radicalement distincte de la recherche disciplinaire, tout en lui étant complémentaire. *La. recherche disciplinaire concerne, tout au plus, un seul et même niveau de réalité* ; d'ailleurs, dans la plupart des cas, elle ne concerne que des fragments d'un seul et même niveau de réalité. En revanche, *la transdisciplinarité s'intéresse à la dynamique engendrée par l'action de plusieurs niveaux de Réalité à la fois.* La découverte de cette dynamique passe nécessairement par la connaissance disciplinaire. La transdisciplinarité, tout en n'étant pas une nouvelle discipline ou une nouvelle hyperdiscipline, se nourrit de la recherche disciplinaire, qui, à son tour, est éclairée d'une manière nouvelle et féconde par la connaissance transdisciplinaire. Dans ce sens, les recherches disciplinaires et transdisciplinaires ne sont pas antagonistes mais complémentaires.

Comme dans le cas de la disciplinante, la recherche transdisciplinaire n'est pas antagoniste mais complémentaire de la recherche pluri et interdisciplinaire. La transdisciplinarité est néanmoins radicalement distincte de la pluridisciplinarité et de l'interdisciplinarité, de par sa finalité, la compréhension du monde présent, qu'il est impossible d'inscrire dans la recherche disciplinaire. La finalité de la pluri et de l'interdisciplinarité est toujours la recherche disciplinaire. Si la transdisciplinarité est si souvent confondue avec l'interdisciplinarité et la pluridisciplinarité (comme, d'ailleurs, l'interdisciplinarité est si souvent confondue avec la pluridisciplinarité), cela s'explique en majeure partie par le fait que toutes les trois débordent les disciplines. Cette confusion est très nocive dans la mesure où elle occulte les finalités différentes de ces trois nouvelles approches.

Tout en reconnaissant le caractère radicalement distinct de la transdisciplinarité par rapport à la disciplinarité, la pluridisciplinarité et l'interdisciplinarité, il serait extrêmement dangereux d'absolutiser cette distinction, auquel cas la transdisciplinarité serait vidée de tout son contenu et son efficacité dans l'action réduite à néant.

La *disciplinante*, la *pluridisciplinarité*, *l´ interdisciplinaryté et* la *transdisciplinarité* sont les quatte flèches d'un seul et même arc : celui de la connaissance.

Si la pluridisciplinarité et l'interdisciplinarité ont fait une entrée timide dans certaines universités, surtout à partir de 1950, en revanche la transdisciplinarité est absente, à part quelques exceptions notables, des structures et programmes de l'université. Malgré leur percée dans le monde universitaire, les expériences pluridisciplinaires et interdisciplinaires ne sont pas considérées, en général, comme très probantes. Les quelques départements pluri ou interdisciplinaires créés dans plusieurs universités, surtout aux USA, ont conduit, dans la plupart des cas, à une simple juxtaposition passive, non-interactive des enseignants ou des étudiants. Du point de vue développé dans le présent projet, cet échec partiel est compréhensible : c'est précisément la transdisciplinarité qui est la condition *sine qua non* d'une interaction féconde et durable entre la disciplinante, la pluridisciplinarité et l'interdisciplinarité. Son absence équivaut à l'absence de *l'orientation* qui donnerait sens aux démarches qui transgressent les frontières disciplinaires. Cette orientation est pleinement explicitée par la Charte de la transdisciplinarité, adoptée au Premier congrès mondial de la Transdisciplinarité, Convento da Arrábida, Portugal, 2-6 novembre 1994 *(voir annexes).*

Repères de l'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'éducation

L'avènement d'une culture transdisciplinaire, qui pourra contribuer à l'élimination des tensions qui menacent la vie sur notre planète, est impossible sans un nouveau type d'éducation, qui prenne en compte *toutes* les dimensions de l'être humain.

Les différentes tensions - économiques, culturelles, spirituelles - sont inévitablement perpétuées et approfondies par un système d'éducation fondé sur les valeurs d'une autre siècle, en décalage accéléré avec les mutations contemporaines. La guerre plus ou moins larvaire des économies, des cultures et des civilisations ne cesse pas de conduire ici et là à la guerre chaude. Au fond, toute notre vie individuelle et sociale est structurée par l'éducation.

En dépit de l'énorme diversité des systèmes d'éducation d'un pays à l'autre, la mondialisation des défis de notre époque entraîne la mondialisation des problèmes de l'éducation. Les secousses qui traversent le domaine de l'éducation, dans un pays ou dans un autre, ne sont que les symptômes d'une seule et même faille entre les valeurs et les réalités d'une vie planétaire en mutation. S'il n'y a, certes, aucune recette-miracle, il y a pourtant un *centre commun d'interrogation* qu'il convient de ne pas occulter si nous désirons vraiment vivre dans un monde plus harmonieux.

Le rapport Delors [1] élaboré par la Commission internationale sur l'éducation pour le vingt et unième siècle, rattachée à l'Unesco et présidée par Jacques Delors, met avec force l'accent sur les quatre piliers d'un nouveau type d'éducation : apprendre à connaître, apprendre à faire, apprendre à vivre ensemble et apprendre à être.

Dans ce contexte, l'approche transdisciplinaire peut avoir une contribution importante dans l'avènement de ce nouveau type d'éducation.

Apprendre à connaître signifie tout d'abord l'apprentissage des méthodes qui nous aident à distinguer ce qui est réel de ce qui est illusoire et avoir ainsi un accès intelligent aux fabuleux savoirs de notre époque. Dans ce contexte *l'esprit scientifique,* un des plus hauts acquis de l'aventure humaine, est indispensable. L'initiation précoce à la science est salutaire car elle donne accès, dès le début de la vie humaine, à l'inépuisable richesse de l'esprit scientifique, fondé sur le questionnement, sur le refus de toute réponse pré-fabriquée et de toute certitude en contradiction avec les faits. Mais l'esprit scientifique ne veut nullement dire l'augmentation inconsidérée de l'enseignement des matières scientifiques et la construction d'un monde intérieur fondée sur l'abstraction et la formalisation. Un tel excès, hélas courant, ne pourrait conduire qu'à l'exact opposé de l'esprit scientifique : les réponses toutes faites d'autre-

(1) L'introduction au *Rapport*, rédigée par Jacques Delors, esc parue dans le n° 3/1997 *d'Associations transnationales*.

fois seraient remplacées par d'autres réponses toutes faites (cette fois-ci avec une sorte de brillance "scientifique") et, en fin de compte, un dogmatisme serait remplacé par un autre. Ce n'est pas l'assimilation d'une énorme masse de connaissances scientifiques qui donne accès à l'esprit scientifique, mais la qualité de ce qui est enseigné. Et "qualité" veut dire ici faire pénétrer l'enfant, l'adolescent ou l'adulte au coeur même de la démarche scientifique qui est le questionnement permanent en relation avec la résistance des faits, des images, des représentations, des formalisations.

Apprendre à connaître veut dire aussi être capable d'établir des passerelles - entre les différents savoirs, entre ces savoirs et leurs significations pour notre vie de tous les jours ; entre ces savoirs et significations et nos capacités intérieures. Cette démarche transdisciplinaire sera le complément indispensable de la démarche disciplinaire, car elle mènera à un *être sans cesse relié*, capable de s'adapter aux exigences changeantes de la vie professionnelle et doté d'une flexibilité restant toujours orientée vers l'actualisation de ses potentialités intérieures.

Apprendre à faire signifie, certes, l'acquisition d'un métier et des connaissances et pratiques qui lui sont associées. L'acquisition d'un métier passe nécessairement par une spécialisation.

Mais, dans notre monde en ebullition, dont le séisme informatique est annonciateur d'autres séismes à venir, se figer route la vie dans un seul et même métier peut être dangereux, car cela risque de conduire au chômage, à l'exclusion, à la souffrance désintégrante de l'être. La spécialisation excessive et précoce esc à bannir dans un monde en rapide changement. Si on veut vraiment concilier l'exigence de la compétition et le souci de l'égalité des chances de tous les êtres humains, tout métier dans l'avenir devrait être un véritable *métier à tisser*, un métier qui serait relié, à l'intérieur de l'être humain, aux fils qui le relient à d'autres métiers. Il ne s'agit pas, bien entendu, d'acquérir plusieurs métiers à la fois mais de bâtir intérieurement un noyau flexible qui donnerait rapidement accès à un autre métier.

Là aussi, la démarche transdisciplinaire peut être précieuse. En fin de compte, "apprendre à faire" est un apprentissage de la créativité. "Faire" signifie aussi faire du nouveau, créer, mettre à jour ses potentialités créatives. C'est cet aspect du "faire" qui est le contraire de l'ennui ressenti, hélas, par tant d'êtres humains qui sont obligés, pour subvenir à leurs besoins, d'exercer un métier en non-conformité avec leurs prédispositions intérieures. "L'égalité des chances" veut dire aussi *la réalisation de potentialités créatives différentes* d'un être à l'autre. "La compétition" peut vouloir dire aussi *l'harmonie des activités créatrices* au sein d'une seule et même collectivité. L'ennui, source de violence, de conflit, de désarroi, de démission morale et sociale peut être remplacé par la joie de la réalisation personnelle, quelle que soit la *place* où cette réalisation s'effectue, car cette place ne peut être qu'unique pour chaque personne à un moment donné.

Bâtir une véritable *personne* veut dire aussi lui assurer les conditions de réalisation maximale de ses potentialités créatrices. La hiérarchie sociale, si souvent arbitraire et artificielle, pourrait être ainsi remplacée par la coopération des *niveaux structurés en fonction de la créativité personnelle*. Ces niveaux seront des *niveaux d'être* plutôt que des niveaux imposés par une compétition qui ne prend nullement en compte l'homme intérieur. L'approche transdisciplinaire est fondée sur l'équilibre entre l'homme extérieur et l'homme intérieur. Sans cet équilibre, "faire" ne signifie rien d'autre que "subir".

Apprendre à vivre ensemble signifie, certes, tout d'abord le respect des normes qui régissent les rapports entre les êtres composant une collectivité. Mais ces normes doivent être vraiment comprises, admises intérieurement par chaque être et non pas subies en tant que contraintes extérieures. "Vivre ensemble" ne veut pas dire simplement tolérer l'autre dans ses différences d'opinion, de couleur de peau et de croyances ; se plier aux exigences des puissants ; naviguer entre les méandres d'innombrables conflits ; séparer définitivement sa vie intérieure de sa vie extérieure ; faire semblant d'écouter l'autre tout en restant convaincu de la justesse absolue de ses propres positions. Sinon, "vivre ensemble se transforme inéluctablement dans son contraire : lutter les uns contre les autres.

L'attitude transculturelle, transreligieuse, transpolitique et transnationale peut être apprise. Elle est innée, dans la mesure où dans chaque être il y a un noyau sacré, intangible. Mais si cette attitude innée n'est que potentielle, elle peut rester pour toujours non-actualisée, absente dans la vie et dans l'action. *Pour que les normes d'une collectivité soient respectées elles doivent être validées par l'expérience intérieure de chaque être.*

Il y a là un aspect capital de l'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'éducation : *se reconnaître soi-même dans le visage de l'Autre*. II s'agit d'un apprentissage permanent, qui doit commencer dans la plus tendre enfance et continuer tout au long de la vie. L'attitude transculturelle, transreligieuse, transpolitique et transnationale nous permettra ainsi de mieux approfondir notre propre culture, de mieux défendre nos intérêts nationaux, de mieux respecter nos propres convictions religieuses ou politiques. L'unité ouverte et la pluralité complexe, comme dans tous les autres domaines de la Nature et de la connaissance, ne sont pas antagonistes.

Apprendre à être apparaît, au prime abord, comme une énigme insondable. Nous savons exister mais comment apprendre à être ? Nous pouvons commencer par apprendre ce que le mot "exister" veut dire, pour nous : découvrir nos conditionnements, découvrir l'harmonie ou la dysharmonie entre notre vie individuelle et sociale, sonder les fondations de nos convictions pour découvrir ce qui se trouve au-dessous. Dans le bâtiment, le stade de la fouille précède celui des fondations. Pour fonder l'être il faut d'abord procéder aux fouilles de nos certitudes, de nos croyances, de nos conditionnements. Questionner, questionner toujours : ici aussi, l'esprit scientifique nous est un guide précieux. Cela s'apprend aussi bien par les enseignants que par les enseignés.

"Apprendre à être" est aussi un apprentissage permanent où l'enseignant informe l'enseigné autant que l'enseigné informe l'enseignant. *La construction d'une personne passe inévitablement par une dimension trans-personnelle.* Le non-respect de cet accord nécessaire explique, en grande partie, une des tensions fondamentales de notre époque, celle entre le matériel et le spirituel. La survie de notre espèce dépend, dans une large mesure, de l'élimination de cette tension, par une conciliation vécue, à un autre *niveau d'expérience* que celui de tous les jours, entre ces deux contradictoires apparemment antagonistes- "Apprendre à être" c'est aussi apprendre à connaître et respecter ce qui relie le Sujet et l'Objet. L'autre est un objet pour moi si je ne fais pas cet apprentissage, qui m'enseigne que, et l'autre et moi, nous bâtissons ensemble le Sujet relié à l'Objet.

H y a une inter-relation assez évidente entre les quatre piliers du nouveau système d'éducation : comment apprendre à faire en apprenant à connaître, et comment apprendre à être en apprenant à vivre ensemble ?

Dans la vision transdisciplinaire, il y a aussi une *trans-relation* qui relie les quatre piliers du nouveau système d'éducation et qui a sa source dans notre propre constitution d'êtres humains. Cette trans-relation est comme le toit qui repose sur les quatre piliers du bâtiment. Si un seul des quatre piliers du bâtiment s'écroule, le bâtiment tout entier s'écroule, le toit avec lui. Et s'il n'y a pas de toit, le bâtiment tombe en ruine.

Une éducation viable ne peut être qu'une *éducation intégrale de l'homme*. Une éducation qui s'adresse à la totalité ouverte de l'être humain et non pas à une seule de ses composantes.

L'éducation actuelle privilégie l'intelligence de l'homme, par rapport à sa sensibilité et à son corps, ce qui a été certainement nécessaire à une époque donnée, pour permettre l'explosion du savoir. Mais cette préférence, si elle continue, va nous entraîner dans la logique folle de l'efficacité pour l'efficacité qui ne peut aboutir qu'à notre autodestruction.

Il ne s'agit pas, bien entendu, de se limiter à augmenter le nombre d'heures prévues pour les activités artistiques ou sportives. Ça serait comme si nous essayions d'obtenir un arbre vivant en juxtaposant des racines, un tronc et une couronne de feuillage. Cette juxtaposition ne conduirait qu'à un faux-semblant d'arbre vivant. L'éducation actuelle ne concerne que la couronne de feuillage. Mais la couronne ne fait pas l'arbre.

Les différentes expériences éducatives montrent que l'intelligence assimile beaucoup plus rapidement et beaucoup mieux les savoirs quand ces savoirs sont *compris* aussi avec le corps et avec le sentiment. Dans un arbre vivant, les racines, le tronc et la couronne de feuillage sont inséparables : c'est à travers eux qu'intervient le mouvement vertical de la sève qui assure la vie de l'arbre. C'est là le prototype de *la révolution de l'intelligence :* l'émergence d'un nouveau type d'intelligence, fondée sur l'équilibre entre l'intelligence analytique, les sentiments et le corps. C'est seulement ainsi que la société du XXIème siècle pourrait concilier effectivité et affectivité.

L'éducation transdisciplinaire éclaire d'une manière nouvelle le besoin qui se fait ressentir de plus en plus actuellement - celui d'une éducation permanence. En effet, l'éducation transdisciplinaire, de par sa propre nature, doit s'exercer non seulement dans les institutions d'enseignement, de l'école maternelle à l'université, mais aussi tout au long de la vie et dans toutes les places de la vie.

Il est bien évident que les différents lieux et les différents âges de la vie réclament des méthodes transdisciplinaires extrêmement diversifiées. Même si l'éducation transdisciplinaire est un processus global et de très longue baleine, il est important de trouver et créer les lieux qui pourront initier ce processus et assurer son développement.

L'université est le lieu privilégié d'une formation adaptée aux exigences de notre temps et il est le pivot d'une éducation dirigée en amont vers les enfants et les adolescents et orientée en aval vers les adultes. L'université pourra ainsi devenir le lieu privilégié d'apprentissage de l'attitude transculturelle, transreligieuse, transpolitique et transnationale, du dialogue entre l'art et la science, axe de la réunification entre la culture scientifique et la culture artistique. L'université renouvelée sera le foyer d'un nouveau type d'humanisme.

Changer de système de référence

Devant l'immense diversité des problèmes auxquels sont confrontées les différentes universités dans un pays ou dans un autre, il serait présomptueux d'essayer de dresser un catalogue de recettes, inévitablement illusoires et inopérantes. D'ailleurs, la notion même de "recette" est contraire à l'esprit transdisciplinaire.

En effet, dans la mesure où la transdisciplinarité correspond à un nouveau mode de connaissance, irréductible à la connaissance disciplinaire, elle engendre une nouvelle théorie et pratique de la décision. Dans l'approche transdisciplinaire il n'y a plus de conditions iniciales bien définies du problème à résoudre. Plus précisément, conséquence immédiate de la complexité intrinsèque du monde où nous vivons, ces conditions dites "initiales" changent sans cesse. Nous constatons cela tous les jours dans notre vie universitaire et pourtant nous nous accrochons encore à l'illusion d'une "réforme" - miracle qui pourrait éliminer les maux dont sont affectées nos universités. Si les conditions initiales des différents problèmes changent sans cesse et si une réforme-miracle est tout simplement impossible, sommes-nous condamnés pour autant à assister, impuissants, à la décadence progressive mais sûre des universités ? La réponse est certainement "non" si nous acceptons de *changer de système de référence,* c'est-à-dire :

1. passer de la considération d'un problème comme s'il dépendait d'un seul niveau de Réalité en le situant dans le champ simultané de plusieurs niveaux de Réalité ;
2. renoncer à trouver la solution d'un problème en termes de "vrai" et de "faux" de la logique binaire, en faisant appel à des nouvelles logiques et, tout particulièrement, à la logique du tiers inclus : la solution d'un problème ne peut-être trouvée que par la *conciliation temporaire des contradictoires* en les reliant à un autre niveau de réalité que celui où ces contradictoires se manifestent ;
3. reconnaître la complexité intrinsèque du problème, c'est-à-dire l'impossibilité de la décomposition de ce problème en des parties simples, fondamentales. En l'absence de fondements, absence qui caractérise notre monde d'aujourd'hui, "changer de système de référence" veut dire aussi prendre comme fondement précisément l'absence des fondements. Autrement dit, remplacer la notion de "fondement" par la *cohérence* de ce monde multidimensionnel et multréférentiel.

La considération simultanée de ces trois piliers méthodologiques de la transdisciplinarité dans chaque *acte* de notre vie universitaire peut paraître d'une exigence extrême et donc irréalisable. De plus, elle peut déclencher toutes sortes de fantasmes et de peurs : l'effacement de territoires disciplinaires, la dissolution du local dans le global, l'annihilation de l'efficacité dans un monde où la compétitivité règne en maître etc. etc. C'est pourquoi cette méthodologie ne doit être appliquée que graduellement, d'une manière pragmatique et avec une grande prudence et rigueur, en prenant comme finalité immédiate *la formation des formateurs.* En effet, en absence d'éducateurs animés par une attitude transdisciplinaire il ne peut y avoir ni évolution transdisciplinaire, ni - coût simplement - évolution de l'université.

Malgré les difficultés méthodologiques que nous venons de mettre en évidence, on peut néanmoins identifier les axes de l'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université :

1. Education intercultutelle et transculturelle, en vue de *bâtir le fondement de la paix et de la compréhension internationale et transnationale.*
2. Considérer le dialogue art-science comme un des axes majeurs de la nouvelle éducation, en vue de la *réunification des deny: cultures* artificiellement antagonistes - culture scientifique et culture artistique - par leur dépassement dans une nouvelle culture multidimensionnelle, condition préalable d'une transformation des mentalités.
3. Intégration de la révolution informatique dans l'éducation universitaire.
4. Éducation inter-religieuse et trans-religieuse en vue d'apprendre à connaître et à apprécier la spécificité des traditions religieuses et a-religieuses qui nous sont étrangères, pour *mieux percevoir les structures communes qui les fondent et parvenir ainsi à une vision trans-veligieuse au monde.* Cet axe concerne à la fois les croyants, les athées et les agnostiques.
5. Éducation transdisciplinaire, en vue de parvenir à *la flexibilité de la formation des jeunes et à l'ouverture d'esprit*, dans un monde où sont présents l'exclusion, le non-accomplissement des aspirations des jeunes, l'inégalité des chances d'auto-réalisation, la rupture entre la vie individuelle et la vie sociale.
6. Éducation transpolitique, en vue de respecter les intérêts des états et des nations dans un monde caractérisé par une globalisation de plus en plus croissante.
7. Prendre les mesures concrètes institutionnelles en vue d'une transdisciplinarité vécue dans la relation entre les enseignants, entre les étudiants et entre les enseignants et les étudiants.

Une autre difficulté surgit ainsi, car il est bien évident qu'il y a une forte corrélation entre tous ces axes, une interdépendance, un conditionnement réciproque.

Cette difficulté peut être, elle aussi, surmontée si on change de système de référence, c'est-à-dire si on identifie la mutation contemporaine de l'espace et du temps où nous vivons et donc des relations de causalité qui régissent nos vies et nos actions.

L'espace territorial d'autrefois est remplacé par l'espace informationnel, de nature quandque et planétaire. A son tour, le temps local d'autrefois est remplacé par un temps mondial, de plus en plus étudié par les sociologues et les philosophes, temps qui est à la fois relié à la Nature et à l'imaginaire et qui détermine l'enchaînement de phénomènes apparemment disconnectés. L'espace informationnel et le temps mondial peuvent être unifiés par la vision transdisciplinaire. Cet espace-temps transdisciplinaire est relié à un nouveau type de causalité qui transcende le local et le global, en les unifiant à un autre niveau de Réalité. On comprend ainsi pourquoi toute solution locale, spécifique à un pays ou un autre, qui ne prend pas en compte la dimension planétaire est destinée d'avance à l'échec ; et, on comprend aussi pourquoi toute solution globale qui ne prend pas en compte la spécificité locale est aussi destinée d'avance à l'échec. Une véritable évolution de l'université requiert le refus de se laisser enfermer dans l'opposition binaire mondialisation-repli sur soi. Au fond, l'université d'aujourd'hui peut retrouver sa dimension universelle (en l'absence de laquelle "université" ne serait qu'un nom abusif et trompeur) si elle sait mettre en mouvement la dynamique transdisciplinaire de l'unité dans la diversité et de la diversité par l'unité, en refusant l'extrémisme soit d'un pragmatisme auto-destructeur soit d'une utopie sans aucune efficacité.

Enfin, une dernière difficulté que nous voulons souligner dans ce passage en revue méthodologique esc reliée à la nature même de ce document de synthèse. En tant que document sur l'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université, il doit être lui-même transdisciplinaire dans sa structure et son contenu et il présuppose que le lecteur de ce document ait lui-même une attitude transdisciplinaire. Autrement dit, ce document présuppose un accord préalable sur *le langage* utilisé, condition qui ne peut pas être remplie automatiquement, car elle demande un changement de système de référence dans le langage lui-même. Cette dernière difficulté peut être surmontée par la consultation des annexes au présent document et de la bibliographie qui y est incluse.

Vers l'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université

L'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université est un processus de très longue baleine et, par conséquent, pour ne pas détruire l'immense potentialité de cette évolution, il est souhaitable, et même nécessaire, de commencer par de tout petits pas tout en tenant compte, à chaque instant, de la finalité de cette évolution. Dans ce chapitre nous allons esquisser quelques propositions, qui sont développées dans les contributions au présent document de synthèse (voir *Annexes) :*

1. Création d'ateliers de recherche transdisciplinaire (ART) dans les universités

La transdisciplinarité n'étant pas une nouvelle discipline, il n'est pas question de créer de nouvelles chaires "transdisciplinaires". En revanche, il est hautement souhaitable de créer, dans quelques universités-pilotes de véritables pôles d'excellence - des *ateliers de recherche transdisciplinaire.* Ces ateliers auront comme mission de faire éclore l'esprit transdisciplinaire par des propositions concrètes concernant la coordination transversale de programmes et les mesures internes institutionnelles à prendre en vue de favoriser l'interaction transdisciplinaire entre les enseignants et les enseignés. Les ateliers joueront le rôle d'un vrai tiers médiateur entre les enseignants et les enseignés. En l'absence d'un vrai tiers, l'interaction entre les enseignants et les enseignés deviendra inévitablement de plus en plus mécanique, se limitant à une transmission d'un savoir de plus en plus envahissant et sans aucune prise sur la vie individuelle et sociale.

Les ateliers doivent être des *structures ouvertes* en intégrant des chercheurs extérieurs à l'université (musiciens, poètes, artistes), des représentants du monde associatif et des représentants des municipalités. Ainsi, avec le temps, les ateliers pourraient devenir des foyers de réflexion et proposition transdisciplinaires concernant le chômage, l'exclusion, la fracture sociale, le travail, l'intégration des minorités.

La composition de ces ateliers doit être *variable dans le temps,* en fonction des nécessités du moment, tout en gardant toujours une orientation transdisciplinaire rigoureuse. Ainsi, *la hiérarchie* ne sera plus personnelle mais *distributive* et fondée exclusivement sur l'autorité ontologique et non pas administrative. La responsabilité de ces ateliers pourrait être confiée à une structure ternaire : un représentant des sciences exactes, un représentant des sciences humaines et un représentant des étudiants. Pour garder une taille propice à la réflexion et à la recherche, l'admission dans ces ateliers pourrait se faire par *cooptation.*

Les ateliers de recherche transdisciplinaire pourront ainsi être le lieu créatif de l'art de vivre et apprendre ensemble, à toutes les échelles. Ces ateliers pourraient constituer de véritables *modèles*^ en stimulant la création de tels ateliers dans toute autre collectivité - entreprise, institution nationale ou institution internationale.

2, Création des unités de formation et de recherche transdisciplinaire (UFRT)

A un niveau plus formel, certaines universités pourraient ressentir le besoin de créer une *unité de formation et de recherche transdisciplinaire,* ayant autorité de décision sur le plan universitaire et chargée de concevoir, dispenser et coordonner l'ensemble des *cours, séminaires et conférences d'ouverture transdisciplinaire.*

Les UFRT auront comme mission d'harmoniser les enseignements à caractère disciplinaire, multidisciplinaire et interdisciplinaire. Elles pourront décider la création *d'enseignements de sensibilisation aux enjeux sociaux, culturels et éthiques*, par le développement de cours traitant des fondements historiques et épistémologiques des différentes disciplines, tout en évitant soigneusement toute dérive idéologique ou réduction niste.

A une étape plus avancée, on peut supposer qu'une université ou une autre, par l'intermédiaire de son UFRT, décide que l'habilitation à diriger des recherches soit conditionnée par le suivi d'un séminaire ou cours d'histoire, de philosophie ou de sociologie des sciences, couronnée par un mémoire sanctionné par la décision d'un jury transdisciplinaire.

3. *Création d'un forum permanent transdisciplinaire d'histoire, de philosophie et de sociologie des sciences (FPT)*

Les ART (sur le plan de fa réflexion et de la recherche) et les UFRT (sur le plan de l'activité universitaire concrète et de la décision) pourront constituer les deux pôles complémentaires permettant l'émergence d'*un forum permanent d'histoire, de philosophie et de sociologie des sciences*, où deux directions privilégiées pourront être l'étude de la philosophie de la Nature et l'étude des aspects anthropologiques. Ce forum pourrait avoir un spectre très large d'activité, des cours et travaux dirigés jusqu'aux débats publics intéressant la population de la ville où l'université est insérée.

Les trois structures nouvelles que nous proposons - les ART, les UFRT et les FPT - pourraient avoir, à long terme, un impact considérable sur la société d'aujourd'hui en traitant de front *la crise de représentation* que nous traversons. Nos moyens de représenter le monde sont, certes, dépassés et ce décalage peut avoir un effet destructif incalculable. La fin des dogmes, le règne absolu du marché, les guerres tribales, les pollutions globales et la déroute génétique sont des signes majeurs de cette crise de représentation. La pensée transdisciplinaire est capable de prendre toute la mesure de cette crise radicale et d'inventer les moyens de la dépasser. Dans le contexte, l'université est un lien privilégié du développement de la pensée et de l'expérience transdisciplinaires.

4. La création des centres d'orientation transdisciplinaire (COT)

Pat rapport aux étudiants, ces centres d'orientation transdisciplinaires (COT) auront une fonction complémentaire par rapport aux centres traditionnels d'orientation. Si l'acquis des savoirs d'une discipline reste une priorité indiscutable, la vie de celui ou celle lancé(e) dans un monde qui semble avoir comme seul critère de valeur l'efficacité à tout prix, est tout aussi importante. La transdisciplinatité essaie de prendre en compte simultanément les deux bouts du bâton - l'homme intérieur et l'homme extérieur - unis par un tiers qu'elle s'efforce de déchiffrer. Les COT pourront conseiller les étudiants dans la direction d'une flexibilité intérieure et d'un auto-apprentissage qui pourraient leur permettre de changer de métier à n'importe quel moment de la vie, pour satisfaire aux besoins de la vie matérielle mais aussi pour actualiser leurs potentialités.

Les COT pourront aussi remplir un rôle *d'orientation des enseignants* qui doivent, eux-aussi, s'adapter à un monde en pleine mutation tout en évitant la stérilisation intellectuelle et spirituelle. Ces COT pourraient jouer le rôle de véritables *observatoires*, tout particulièrement en relation avec l'évolution du système éducatif sous l'influence de la révolution informatique.

Les COT pourront créer un espace d'éveil et de réveil de différents niveaux d'intelligence et d'esprit créatif ainsi que de relation entre une démocratie cognitive et l'esprit vivant.

5. *Création de lieux de silence et de méditation transreligieuse et transculturelle*

À l'image des monstrueuses mégalopoles, certaines universités sont, du point de vue architectural et de la distribution des espaces, de gigantesques hypermarchés du savoir, au mépris de tout sens esthétique et poétique, si nécessaire à une vie réelle. Dans de tels espaces l'esprit d'exclusion, de mépris, d'ignorance de l'autre, d'indifférence par rapport à tout ce qui est différent de soi-même ne peur que s'accentuer et se propager dans la vie de l'adulte actif que l'étudiant va devenir à la fin de ses études.

Dans ce contexte la création de lieux destinés exclusivement au silence et à la méditation pourront jouer un rôle important dans l'engendrement de l'esprit de tolérance. Ces lieux doivent évidemment être, conformément à l'esprit laïque de l'université, des lieux transreligieux et transculturels, où chacun pourrait communiquer avec l'autre dans le silence nourri par sa propre religion et sa propre culture. Dans la perspective transdisciplinaire, le silence met en jeu un niveau extrêmement riche d'information, à partir duquel une communication et même une communion peuvent s'établir.

6. Vers le partage universel des connaissances : relier l'université au domaine public du cyber-espace-temps

L'avènement du cyber-espace-temps représente, plus que la chute du mur de Berlin, une fabuleuse chance pour la démocratie, pour le développement individuel et social et pour le partage universel des connaissances. À condition, bien entendu, que ce même cyber espace-temps ne soit pas perverti en une immense pompe à finances. Le support des créations diffusées dans le *cyber-espace-temps* est de la texture des tréfonds de la matière, aux portes du monde quantique. Autrement dit, du point de vue scientifique, l'espace cyber est d'une nature radicalement différente de notre espace habituel. Si la terre peut être partagée en des territoires dont les frontières séparent les différents états-nations et les différents peuples du monde, un tel partage de l'espace cyber serait, tout simplement, contre-nature. C'est là l'assise scientifique de la nécessité d'une vision résolument nouvelle sur l'évolution du domaine public, quant à ses fins, son étendue et sa qualité. Dans le *cyber-espace-temps*, le domaine public est de nature planétaire et non pas nationale.

Le *cyber-espace-temps* pourrait devenir, si les organisations nationales et internationales ont le courage et l'intelligence de faire émerger une vision nouvelle du domaine public, un fabuleux réservoir énergétique et dynamique de développement des universités du monde entier. Une université de quelque pays que ce soit, développé ou en voie de développement, devrait avoir la possibilité de se connecter à toutes les bases de données du *cyber-espace-temps*. On pourrait ainsi *transférer dans le cyber-espace-temps toutes les tâches mécaniques de l'enseignement, en opérant ainsi une véritable libération des enseignants leur permettant de se concentrer sur la créativité, le dialogue et l'interaction avec les étudiants*. *Apprendre à apprendre* pourrait être la mission de l'enseignant de demain - apprendre à penser, apprendre à créer, apprendre à relier ce qui est épars et à éliminer ce qui est contingent. Remplacer ainsi le savoir par la compréhension, la possession rigide des savoirs par la capacité de reliance et d'invention, le *curriculum mortis* par le *curriculum vitce*.

La libération des enseignants signifie aussi la libération des étudiants : ils seront libres de *rechercher leur juste place dans la société et à l'intérieur d'eux-mêmes* au lieu de rester esclaves d'un système économique indifférent à leur être réel.

L'impact social d'une telle métamorphose de l'université est considérable car un *nouveau lien social* pourrait ainsi s'établir. Les concepts nouveaux comme ceux de transculture, transreligion, transpolitique ou transnationalité, forgés par les chercheurs transdisciplinaires du CIRET et d'ailleurs, pourraient ainsi germer dans le monde de l'éducation universitaire, s'incarner et se propager ensuite à l'échelle de la planète.

Une nouvelle solidarité est en train de naître. Les universités du monde entier, par leur connexion au *cyber-espace-temps*, deviendront les maillons d'une gigantesque et virtuelle université des universités, lieu vrai de l'universel. Le fossé dangereux et explosif entre les inforiches et infopauvres pourrait se réduire progressivement grâce aussi à la nouvelle éducation universitaire.

D'ailleurs ce processus est un processus en boucle : il s'auto-alimente et s'auto-organise. La création *des forums de discussion sur l'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université sur Internet*, que nous préconisons, est hautement souhaitable. L'Observatoire pour l'étude de l'université du futur (OEUF), créé par l'École polytechnique fédérale de Lausanne en collaboration avec le CIRET (http://www-uf.epfl.ch/UF/), est le lieu virtuel capable de modérer un tel forum. Et d'un tel OEUF sortira, peut-être, ce que nous appelons tous de nos vœux et de nos efforts : l'université du Futur.

Enfin, le cyber-espace-temps, permettrait le jumelage virtuel des universités en quête de leur évolution transdisciplinaire.

7. Conclusions

Riguear, tolérance et ouverture sont trois concepts mis en avant par la Charte de Transdisciplinarité. Nous avons essayé de "mettre en vie" ces trois concepts dans le présent document.

Dans ce document de synthèse, nous nous sommes limités volontairement à quelques repères de l'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université. Les quelques propositions que nous présentons sont faites loin de toute "méthodolâtrie", en laissant chacun faire son propre chemin.

Certes, la transdisciplinarité n'est pas neutre car elle fait l'option du sens. Une éducation neutre et objective n'est qu'un fantasme qui nous a été légué par l'idéologie scientiste. La transdisciplinarité a comme ambition l'unification , dans leur différence, de l'objet et du sujet : le sujet-connaisseur fait partie intégrante de la Nature et de la connaissance.

L'évolution transdisciplinaire de l'université n'est ni un luxe, ni un aménagement cosmétique d'une institution menacée, ni une décoration agréable mais superflue sur un vieux et véritable bâtiment, mais une nécessité. *La vocation transdisciplinaire de l'université est inscrite dans sa propre nature :* l'étude de l'universel est inséparable de la mise en relation des champs disciplinaires, en cherchant ce qui se trouve entre, à travers et au-delà de tous les champs disciplinaires.

Conclusions du séminaire sur l'application de la Convention européenne sur la reconnaissance de la personnalité juridique des organisations internationales non gouvernementales*

La Convention européenne sur la reconnaissance de la personnalité juridique des organisations internationales non gouvernementales est à ce jour le seul instrument normatif international en vigueur en matière d'ONG.

Un séminaire sur l'application de cette Convention s'est tenu à Strasbourg les 9 et 10 février 1998. Les participants ont procédé à l'examen de certains concepts et termes utilisés dans le texte de cette Convention en vue de mieux clarifier son application.

Au terme des travaux, des points de convergence entre les participants ont pu être dégagés sur certains aspects des thèmes débattus.

A. Interprétation et application de la Convention 124

1. La notion "d'autres institutions privées" (Article 1)

Le terme autres institutions privées englobe des institutions qui dans certains Etats ont la personnalité juridique (congrégation religieuse, syndicat, mutuelle, etc) et ont des buts et des structures semblables à ceux des associations sans nécessairement être juridiquement considérées comme telles. Ces trois types d'institutions ont bien une valeur indicative de la diversité du monde des ONG. Il est recommandé que les parties se fondent sur la liste indicative telle qu'elle figure dans le rapport explicatif étant entendu que chaque pays en fera l'application qu'il estime conforme à sa propre loi.

2. La notion "d'utilité internationale" (Article La)

Le préambule de la Convention souligne que "les organisations internationales non gouvernementales exercent une activité utile à la communauté internationale notamment dans les domaines scientifique, culturel, charitable, philanthropique, de la santé et de l'éducation et contribuent à la réalisation des buts et principes de la Charte des Nations Unies et du Statut du Conseil de l'Europe", ce qui donne des éléments essentiels pour l'interprétation de cette expression.

En outre, les critères d'octroi du statut consultatif auprès du Conseil de l'Europe et auprès des Nations Unies faisant déjà l'objet d'un accord intergouvernemental, les ONG dotées de l'un ou l'autre de ces statuts sont susceptibles d'être reconnues comme répondant au critère d'utilité internationale tel qu'il est précisé à l'Article La de fa Convention.

Pour ce qui concerne les procédures nationales de reconnaissance d'utilité publique, la plupart des lois nationales en énumèrent les critères, spécifiques d'une part, comme l'éducation, la santé, les services sociaux, l'art, et généraux d'autre part, comme l'utilité sociale. Ces critères pourront également être pris en compte au niveau international.

La notion d'utilité internationale ne saurait toutefois être appréciée uniquement d'un point de vue national.

3. La notion de "capacité juridique" (Article 2.1)

Pour renforcer l'idée que l'ONG doit avoir dans tous les Etats contractants la même capacité juridique que celle obtenue dans ['Etat où le siège se trouve, il esc important de rappeler que le Conseil de l'Europe constitue une communauté liée par le respect des droits de l'homme et des principes de la démocratie, donc un espace homogène caractérisé par une certaine reconnaissance mutuelle entre systèmes juridiques. Il en résulte que le choix du siège dans l'un des Etats membres peut être respecté et reconnu par les autres Etats membres, en raison de la similitude d'approches juridiques fondées sur l'adhésion à des principes communs.

4. La notion "d'intérêt public essentiel" (Article 2.2) qui permettait l'application de "restrictions, limitations ou procédures spéciales"

Aux termes de la Convention 124, les organisations non gouvernementales ne devraient

* Organisé par le Conseil de l'Europe à Strasbourg, les 9 et 10 février 1998.

Transnational Associations, 3/1998,160-162.

se voir opposer de restrictions ou limitations dans l'exercice des droits découlant de leur capacité juridique que pour des raisons présentant une importance majeure pour l'Etat concerné. Les termes de l'Article 2.2 et par ailleurs ceux de l'Article 4.4 sont de nature à encourager les Etats membres à ratifier la Convention.

5. La notion de "preuve de l'acquisition de la personnalité et de la capacité juridiques" (Article 3.1)

Aux fins de la reconnaissance par une Partie contractante de la personnalité et de la capacité juridiques d'une ONG, cette Partie ou l'ONG peut demander à l'Etat du siège statutaire de cette ONG de fournit la preuve de l'acquisition de la personnalité et de la capacité juridiques (c'est-à-dire, la présentation des statuts ou autres actes constitutifs accompagnés des pièces établissant l'autorisation administrative, l'enregistrement ou toute autre forme de publicité). Une fois les preuves produites en bonne et due forme, la personnalité et la capacité juridiques sont reconnues de plein droit par cette Partie contractante. Aucune procédure spéciale ne doit être suivie à cet effet.

En l'absence de procédure de publicité dans un pays, l'Article 3.1 de la Convention prévoit que "l'acte constitutif de l'ONG sera dûment certifié par une autorité compétente. Lors de la signature ou du dépôt de l'instrument de ratification, d'approbation, d'acceptation ou d'adhésion, l'Etat concerné indiquera l'identité de cette autorité au Secrétaire Général du Conseil de l'Europe".

Pour faciliter la recherche d'information, il est recommandé que le Conseil de l'Europe tienne à jour une liste des autorités ou institutions qui dans chaque pays sont compétentes pour certifier l'acte constitutif d'une ONG ou fournir d'autres informations utiles. Cette liste serait communiquée aux parties intéressées à intervalles réguliers.

6. *Les termes "compromet les relations avec un autre Etat" (Article 4.b)*

Le principe général selon lequel une ONG ne saurait se livrer sur le territoire d'un Etat à des activités nuisibles à cet Etat ou à un autre Etat s'applique pleinement. Toutefois, ne saurait être interprétée comme compromettant les relations avec un autre Etat, une activité dont le but serait de promouvoir les valeurs qu'incarné le Conseil de l'Europe ou les principes de la Charte des Nations Unies ainsi que les conventions et pactes dans le domaine des droits de l'homme et du droit humanitaire international.

B. Nouvelles ratifications de la Convention 124

1. A la lumière de la décision des délégués des ministres adoptée lors de leur 593e réunion le 28 mai 1997, décision attirant l'attention des gouvernements sur la Convention 124, les participants au séminaire reconnaissent que les organisations non-gouvernementales sont de plus en plus un élément fondamental dans Ja représentation du monde moderne et que cette évolution est inséparable de l'aspiration à la liberté et à la démocratie qui anime les Etats membres du Conseil de l'Europe.

Ils encouragent donc vivement tous les Etats membres qui n'ont pas encore ratifié la Convention 124 à entamer les procédures menant à la ratification dans les meilleurs délais.

C. Perspectives futures

Les participants au séminaire expriment leur gratitude au gouvernement français pour avoir soumis une note de fond soulevant un certain nombre de questions de principe ayant trait à la formulation de plusieurs articles et aux modalités d'application de la Convention 124.

Tout en réaffirmant, comme mention en a été faite plus haut, que la priorité dans l'immédiat est la ratification de la Convention 124 par l'ensemble des Etats membres du Conseil de l'Europe, les participants considèrent opportun de favoriser l'élaboration d'une Convention plus large accordant un statut juridique international aux organisations internationales non gouvernementales. Les organisations non gouvernementales nationales ayant une action internationale pourraient être prises en compte dans le même contexte.

Le Secrétariat est invité à recueillir les contributions écrites et les propositions gouvernementales et non-gouvernementales qui lui seront soumises sur le contenu d'une éventuelle future convention.

Par ailleurs, il est suggéré que les clarifications et précisions qui ont pu être dégagées par les participants au séminaire soient incorporées ultérieurement dans un texte juridique approprié telle qu'une recommandation.

Dans l'immédiat, pour favoriser une meilleure connaissance de la Convention 124 et faciliter son application, le texte des présentes conclusions pourraient utilement faire l'objet d'une large diffusion auprès des autorités et autres milieux intéressés.

The UN Security Council and the International Criminal Court: how should they relate?*

In June of 1998 a diplomatic conference will convene in Rome, Italy, to approve a treaty establishing a permanent International Criminal Court (ICC), perhaps the most important international institutional innovation since the creation of the United Nations. Years of negotiations, debate, and compromise have been devoted to this endeavor. The eventual effectiveness of the ICC will depend on how states resolve a set of interrelated issues involving the court's relationship with the UN Security Council, the independence of the prosecutor, and the court's jurisdiction. At issue is the need to honor and effectuate the international rule of law through judicial means without compromising the Security Council's singular role in ensuring international peace and security. The purpose of the Stanley Foundation conference was to bring together key players to discuss these critical issues with the hope of facilitating consensus. Participants assessed the strengths and weaknesses of the current draft statute which negotiators are refining and consolidating in anticipation of the Rome treaty conference.

ICC/Security Council relations

In theory, there should be no conflict between the ICC and the UN Security Council. To the extent the threat of prosecution deters criminal behavior and to the extent justice enables peace, the ICC will play a critically important role in helping maintain international peace. However, their functions ate also fundamentally different: UN member states have entrusted the Security Council with the inherently political task of maintaining international peace and security, while the ICC would be a judicial mechanism designed to bring war criminals to justice and advance the international rule of law. Depending on the cirumstances, external judicial intervention has the potential to compromise, as well as foster, peace and national reconciliation; thus, *how* the Security Council fulfills its role may alternatively complement and frustrate the workings of the proposed court.

A clear majority agreed that the Security Council should be able to refer to the court particular situations where it suspects criminal behavior of a dimension requiring the international community's intervention. Conference participants forwarded a number of reasons why this tight should be clearly written into the court's statute:

- The Security Council, as the preeminent international body entrusted with maintaining peace, should have standing, like a prosecutor, to initiate judicial intervention.
- By referring a situation to the ICC, the Security Council would shoulder part of the political burden associated with pursuing sensitive investigations and prosecutions, and states would feel additional pressure to cooperate with the ICC knowing that the investigation is at the behest of the Security Council.
- A clear right of referral would eliminate ambiguities that often spark turf battles between international institutions, fostering the cooperation and harmony that will be needed to make the court effective.
- Without the right to refer situations to the ICC, the Security Council would have the incentive to create additional ad hoc tribunals whose dockets it could better control.
" Under the draft statute, both state parties and the Security Council may refer situations to the court for investigation. If the Security Council is denied this right, the ICC would be reduced to merely an instrument of state parties. This right of referral would also enable the Security Council to step in the face of state parties reluctance.

There was less consensus regarding the legal basis upon which the Security Council would exercise this right of referral. The current draft bases the authority in Chapter VII of the UN Charter which grants the Security Council certain enforcement powers. While some believed the Security Council should be able to refer situations under *any* authority, others suggested referral be made under Chapter VI as well (whereby the Security Council would be merely *recommending* the ICC investigate *a* situation, as opposed to requiring it). Still others believed the statute could remain silent with respect to the authority.

This document is a summary of the Report of the Twenty-Ninth United Nations Issues Conference sponsored by the Stanley foundation February 20-22,1998, convened at Arden House, Harriman, New York. It is reproduced here by kind permission of the Stanley Foundation.

Transnational Associations, 3/1998,163-166.

Security Council power to halt ICC proceeding

The draft statute also empowers the Security Council to prevent or halt prosecution if it is related to or arises from a dispute or situation that "is being dealt with" by the Security Council. Some participants believed the Security Council must retain this right, arguing that given the potential political ramifications, it may be inappropriate for the court to commence or continue proceedings related to issues that are before the council. Most participants, however, opposed granting the Security Council this right as it would compromise the independence of the court, allowing a political body to control a judicial body thereby politicizing the court become a bargaining chip during peace negotiations. Granting this power to the Security Council also implies chat justice can disrupt Security Council-sponsored peace négociations, undermining growing international appreciation of the critical role justice plays in solidifying the peace.

There was general support for alternative language proposed last year by the Singapore delegation which puts the onus on the Security Council to vote to halt an ICC proceeding of it determines that the proceeding would be detrimental to international peace ans security. Some participants favored this proposal because Security Council jurisdiction is presumed, but, unlike the current language, the Security Council would need to make a public and politically sensitive finding that contiuation of an investigation or prosecution is unwise. This would discourage overt of excessive intervention by the Security Council. While the Singapore proposal was preferred, many participants expressed reservations due to ambiguities in the next. Most important, there was uncertainty regarding at which stage in a criminal proceeding the Security Council would be able to exercise this right.

Independence of the prosecutor

Under the current draft, the ICC prosecutor may conduce investigations only after either the Security Council or a state party (or a group fo state parties) refers a general situation to the court. There is a strong movement of give the prosecutor the authority to decide independently whether to initiate an investigation, A few participants opposed such independence citing the risk of abuse. For most participants, however, the advantages far outweigh any disadvantages. For example, il, for political reasons, neither the Security Council nor state parties refer a situation of international criminal behavior to the ICC, the prosecutor would have the independence to commence an investigation on her on his own initiative. This group rejected as unrealistic fears of a prosecutor "running wild" or otherwise acting in bad faith, calling attention to the various procedural protections within the statute as well as financial constraints on the prosecutor. Taken together, the safeguards will ensure the prosecutor will not be actiong alone.

Participants discussed how to shield the prosecutor from undue political pressure to investigate and prosecute, or to refrain from investigating or prosecuting. Most participants approved of the internal indictment review process in the current draft and recommended additions to current safeguards. For example, the prosecutor could be required to seek permission from a special chamber to begin the investigation and would be given a time limit to carry it out.

Jurisdiction

The three core crimes that the ICC will be authorized to hear are genocide, crimes against humanity, and serious violations of the laws and customs of war. Whether the court may actually exercise jurisdiction in any given case will depend on it satisfying different jurisdiction requirements, some of which are controversial. Any state that becomes a party to the ICC statute automatically submits to the court's jurisdiction over the crime of genocide. But with respect to crimes against humanity and war crimes, the state has a choice.

While a few participants approved of this liberality with respect of jurisdiction, arguing the opt-in regime will make che treaty politically easier for state to ratify. Most participants, however, were opposed and argued chat the ICC's inherent jurisdiction should extend to all three core crimes. It would be duplicitous for a state to claim to be ratifying the ICC statute when it is in fact "opting out" of crimes. Moveover, it is questionable whether a state may legally "opt out" of jurisdiction over a crime that is considered part of internacional customary law. In addition, the international community could find itself with a court used against democratic states by states that abuse human rights. If the consent regime is to be retained, restructuring was recommended.

Participants discussed the merits of including aggression and various treaty-based crimes in the court's subject matter jurisdiction as well. Under the current draft, a complaint alleging aggression may be brought before the court if the Security Council first makes a determination that a state has committed aggression. Some participants argued that referral by the Security Council of a suspected crime of aggression would have no impact on the ICC's decision, but participants questioned that assumption and cautioned that the relationship between the ICC and the Security Council would become much more political and delicate. The political pressure to validate the Security Council would be immense. There was no consensus on the extent to which treaty crimes should be included in ICC statute, although expanding jurisdiction to other treaty-based crimes may bring more countries to support the court. Overall, however, participants were wary of extending the jurisdiction of che court at this late stage because delegations would have to choose which treaties to include, which would in turn require identifying those that have reached the status of international customary law. Moreover, an entirely new consent regime parallel to what is already in che statute would need to be created to accommodate them.

The road ahead

Participants were of varying opinions with respect to what can reasonably be accomplished before the Rome treaty conference. A few participants believed issues related to the Security Council powers, che independent prosecutor, jurisdiction, and the consent regime will not be resolved until the last hour as part of the package deal. Others were more hopeful.

The facilitate negotiations during the last stages, efficient state consultations, perhaps with intermediaries, and more intersessional meetings will be required. It would be helpful to develop a streamlined draft with annotations so delegations may know who proposed what and their rationale. This would greatly assist chose who will be dealing wich the ICC for the first time at the Rome conference. The sensitive political issues and more technical issues should be negociated separately, with the latter addressed first. There has been clarification recently on controversial issues including the role of the Security Council, jurisdiction, and the national security exception, but ther is much mote room for more compromise.

Some felt delegations should not sacrifice efficacy of the court for the sake of having it ratified. A weak court may not survive inevitable changes that could occur in the international system in the near or far future. Therefore, essential points of principle should not be conceded simply to maximize the number of countries ratifying the treaty. Others believed it would be better to accept a less-than-optimal court than to leave Rome with nothing. It would be preferable to achieve something now before momentum withers. Some were hopeful that delegations could come away from Rome with both the best court possible and to do so in the time allotted. Failure in Rome would be a huge stumbling block politically to a second try, no matter how far off in the future. Proponents of the court can "have their cake and eat it too".

Parliamentary considerations

The challenge for delegations and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) will be to persuade government officials, legislatures, and parliament of the wisdom of this court, particularly the US administration and Congress.

Although there are members with the House and Senate who ate sympathetic to the ICC, a vast majority has no interest. It was anticipated that most congressional debate will focus on complementarity, the process of selecting judges and jurisdiction, trigger mechanisms, and due process protections. There will be fear of unwarranted, politically motivated prosecution of US peacekeeping forces. A strong complementarity regime would go a long way in garnering US support and assuaging many congressional fears. Problems experienced in Congress will plague other legislatures as well.

Promoting and lobbying for the Court

Some participants believed proponents of the court need to dedicate more time educating the public and legislators on the need for and operation of a future international criminal court. The ICC must be made understandable. A public education and lobbying campaign would do best to focus on what the ICC is for to enable the international community to prosecute humanity's most heinous and egregious crimes. Civil society will play a crucial role in educating the public and promoting the court. Of course, NGO support would depend on what is produced in Rome.

There is a feeling that this project is different from others, that there is an urgency and seriousness unlike other endeavors in treaty-making. In the time that remins before che Rome conference, delegations and NGOs will need to be imaginative problem solvers and work hard to bridge opposing concepts and proposals in a way satisfactory to all. In the long run it will be a well-functioning court that will garner the most support. Once the credibility, prestige, and strength of the court are established, it is anticipated that the court will be universally accepted.

The people's communication charter

We, the Signatories of this Charter, recognize that:

Communication is basic to the life of all individuals and their communities. All people are entitled to participate in communication, and in making decisions about communication within and between societies. The majority of the world's peoples lack minimal technological resources for survival and communication. Over half of them have not yet made a single telephone call. Commercialization of media and concentration of media ownership erode the public sphere and fail to provide for cultural and information needs, including the plurality of opinions and the diversity of cultural expressions and languages necessary for democracy. Massive and pervasive media violence polarizes societies, exacerbates conflict, and cultivates fear and mistrust, making people vulnerable and dependent. Stereotypical portrayals misrepresent all of us and stigmatize those who are the most vulnerable. Therefore, we ratify this Charter defining communication rights and responsibilities to be observed in democratic countries and in international law.

Respect and freedom (articles 1 and 2)

All are entitled to be treated with respect, according to the basic human rights standards of dignity, integrity, identity, and non-discrimination. All people have the right of access to communication channels independent of governmental or commercial control.

Access (article 3)

In order to exercise their rights, people should have fair and equitable access to local and global resources and facilities for conventional and advanced charnels of communication; to receive opinions, information and ideas in a language they normally use and understand; to receive a range of cultural products designed for a wide variety of tastes and interests; and to have easy access to facts about ownership of media and sources of information.

Independence (article 4)

The realization of people's right to participate in, contribute to and benefit from the development of self-reliant communication structures requires international assistance to the development of independent media; training programmes for professional mediaworkers; the establishment of independent, representative associations, syndicates or trace unions of journalists and associations of editors and publishers; and the adoption of international standards.

Literacy (article 5)

All people have the right to acquire information and skills necessary to participate fully in public deliberation and communication. This requires facility in reading, writing and storytelling; critical media awareness; computer literacy; and education about the role of communication in society.

Protection of journalists (article 6)

Journalists must be accorded full protection of the law, including international humanitarian law, especially in areas of armed conflict. They must have safe, unrestricted access to sources of information, and must be able to seek remedy, when required, through an international body.

Right of reply and redress (article 7)

All people have the right of reply and to demand penalties for damage from media misinformation. Individuals concerned should have an opportunity to correct, without undue delay, statements relating to them which they have a justified interest in having corrected. Such corrections should be given the same prominence as the original expression.

Cultural identity (article 8)

All people have the right to protect their cultural identity. This includes the respect for people's pursuit of their cultural development and the right to free expression in languages they understand. People's right to the protection of their cultural space and heritage should not violate other human rights or provisions • of this Charter.

Diversity of languages (article 9)

All people have the right to a diversity of languages. This includes the right to express themselves and have access to information in their own language.

Participation in policy making (article 10)

All people have the right to participate in public decision-making about the provision of information; the development and utilization of knowledge; the preservation, protection and development of culture; the choice and application of communication technologies; and the structure and policies of media industries.

Children's rights (article 11)
Children have the right to mass media products that are designed to meet their needs and interests and foster their healthy physical, mental and emotional development. They should be protected from harmful media products and from commercial and other exploitation at home, in school and at places of play, work, or business.

Cyberspace (article 12)
All people have the right to universal access to and equitable use of Cyberspace. Their rights to free and open communities in Cyberspace, their freedom of electronic expression, and their freedom from electronic surveillance and intrusion, should be protected.

Privacy (article 13)
All people have the right to be protected from the publication of allegations irrelevant to the public interest, or of private photographs or other private communication, without authorization, or of personal information given or received in confidence.

Harm (article 14)
People have the right to demand that media actively counter incitement to hate, prejudice, violence and war. Violence should not be presented as normal, «manly», or entertaining, and true consequences of and alternatives to violence should be shown. Other violations of human dignity and integrity to be avoided include Stereotypie ¡mages that distort the realities and complexities of people's rives. Media should not ridicule, stigmatize, or demonize people on the basis of gender, race, class, ethnicity, language, sexual orientation, and physical or mental condition.

Justice (article 15)
People have the right to demand that media respect standards of due process in the coverage of trials. This implies that the media should not presume guilt before a verdict of guilt, invade the privacy of defendants, and should not televise criminal trials in real time, while the trial is in progress.

Consumption (article 16)
People have the right to useful and factual consumer information and to be protected against misleading and distorted information. Media should avoid and, if necessary, expose promotion disguised as news and entertainment (infomercials, product placement, children's programmes that use franchised characters and toys, etc.), and the creation of wasteful, unnecessary, harmful or ecologically damaging needs, wants, products and activities. Advertising directed at children should receive special scrutiny,

Accountability (article 17)
People have the right to hold media accountable to the general public and their adherence to the standards established in this Charter. For that purpose, media should establish mechanisms, including self-regulatory bodies, that monitor and account for measures taken to achieve compliance.

Implimentation (article 18)
In consultation with the Signatories, national and international mechanisms will be organized to publicize this Charter, to implement it in as many countries as possible and in international law; monitor and assess the performance of countries and media in light of these Standards; receive complaints about violations, advise on adequate remedial measures; and to establish procedures for periodic review, development and modification of this Charter.

The People's Communication Charter is an initiative of the Third World Network (Penang, Malaysia), the Centre for Communication & Human Rights (Amsterdam, the Netherlands), the Cultural Environment Movement (USA), and AMARC-World Association of Community Radio Broadcasters (Peru and Canada).

(*Common Concern* n° 95, September 1997)

Déclaration du Forum permanent de la société civile

Après Amsterdam: ouvrir la voie à un véritable pacte constitutionnel de l'Union

Le Forum Permanent de la Société Civile a rendu publique une déclaration sur le Traité d'Amsterdam. Le Forum des Migrants a souscrit à cette déclaration dont nous publions ci-dessous le contenu.

"Pour une Europe des Citoyens, vision et stratégie.

1. A la veille de la révision du Traité de Maastricht, le Forum permanent de la société civile avait lancé un avertissement. "Ce n'est plus l'heure de la démocratie secrète ni de compromis ambigus reflets de méfiances réciproques", avait souligné l'appel signé par cent organisations et associations européennes en indiquant ensuite les huit priorités de la société civile pour la réforme de l'Union:

- une véritable dimension européenne de la citoyenneté;
- le renforcement et la garantie des droits de la personne humaine;
- les moyens pour réaliser la cohésion économique et sociale;
- un système de décision basée sur la démocratie représentative et participative;
- le droit à l'information;
- le rôle des services d'intérêt général;
- le renforcement du rôle de l'Union dans le monde;
- la reconnaissance des associations et des organisations non gouvernementales.

2. Selon le Forum, les résultats de la révision du Traité de Maastricht auraient dû ouvrir la voie à un véritable pacte constitutionnel affirmant les valeurs et principes sur lesquels sont basées nos sociétés et garantissant la réalisation des priorités indiquées par la société civile, ce qui aurait renforcé le sentiment d'appartenance des citoyens à l'Union

3. Convaincu que la construction de l'Union devrait venir non seulement de l'action des gouvernements mais surtout de la participation directe des citoyens et de leurs représentants élus, le Forum a décidé de donner sa contribution à l'élaboration de ce pacte constitutionnel en rédigeant une "charte des citoyennes et des citoyens de l'Europe". Cette charte, soumise au Parlement européen sous forme d'une pétition, constitue pour le Forum un instrument fondamental pour évaluer tout progrès de la construction de l'Union.

Résultat d'Amsterdam

4. Les résultats de la révision du Traité de Maastricht sont très satisfaisants au regard des points rappelés en 1 et en particulier du point de vue des droits de fa personne humaine et de la citoyenneté européenne.

5. Dans ces conditions, en l'absence d'engagements précis sur les éléments indiqués ci-dessus, la distance entre les citoyens européens et les institutions de l'Union serait destinée à s'accroître, ce qui pourrait faire surgir des obstacles dans les procédures de ratification du Traité d'Amsterdam.

6. La société civile attend de l'Union qu'elle mette la personne au coeur de son projet et lasse prévaloir le besoin de réorienter la mondialisation. En raison des résultats décevants quant à une Europe des Citoyens, le Forum est amené à lier le processus de ratification du Traité et les élections européennes de 1999. Il en appelle au Parlement Européen pour qu'avant la fin de la présente législature, il prenne des initiatives fortes pour renforcer la place du Parlement, seule instance représentative des citoyens européens, et définir l'espace civique et démocratique, économique, social et culturel de la citoyenneté européenne.

Demande de quatre initiatives fortes et complémentaires au Traité d'Amsterdam

7. Le Forum demande quatre initiatives fortes qui sont des éléments sine qua non permettant un large soutien de la société civile à la ratification du Traité d'Amsterdam :

- une Résolution conjointe du Conseil européen et du Parlement européen relative à un processus constitutionnel pour toute révision ultérieure du Traité
- une Charte des Citoyennes et Citoyens Européens adoptée par le Parlement Européen, définissant les missions de l'Union au service de la personne humaine et le contenu de la citoyenneté européenne tant sur le plan démocratique et civique qu'économique, social et culturel
- « un Contrat Social Européen, mettant en oeuvre la citoyenneté européenne sur le plan économique, social et culturel et prenant sa place dans le cadre des réponses que l'Union doit donner aux rendez-vous du XXIe siècle.
- une interprération du Traité d'Amsterdam garantissant le plein respect des droits fondamentaux de la personne humaine et une mise sur pied d'égalité des politiques monétaire, économique et sociale.

8. Le Forum lance dès maintenant une grande campagne de mobilisation décentralisée au sein de ses propres organisations et associations, au niveau européen, national, régional et local."

Bruxelles,
le 10 septembre
1997

NGOs call on the E.P. and development cooperation ministers to be vigilant

While European ministers are getting ready to negotiate their future relations with the ACP countries (Development Council, Monday 18 May), the European Commission, in submitting its budgetary proposals for 1999, is sending out a worrying political signal to developing countries. European Development NGOs are outraged: these budget proposals contradict the EU's officially-declared policy, which is to eradicate poverty from the world. Meanwhile, the G8 Summit (which includes EU countries) is being held in Birmingham this week-end - what is it going to do about poor countries' debt?

Do we want to finance the enlargement of the EU with money from the Poor in the third world? Because the preliminary draft budget plans, de facto, to increase financing for Central and Eastern Europe (PHARE: by a 43% rise) with funds taken from development cooperation. Many so-called "third world" lines are affected, but those intended in general for civil society are the worst hit. A reduction of around 26% (100 million EURO) is being proposed in all the B7-6 lines, which cover various kinds of development cooperation work such as NGO projects and programmes, decentralized cooperation, rehabilitation and reconstruction, family planning and reproductive health, the environment and even human rights.

The root of the problem still lies in the decision taken by the Summit in Cannes, to allocate increasingly large sums from 1995 to 1999 to the countries of Central and Eastern Europe, on the one hand (from 1,154 million ECU in 1995 to 1,634 million ECU in 1999), and to non-EU Mediterranean countries on the other (from 555 million ECU in 1995 to 1,143 million ECU in 1999). The EU States made these commitments without providing for any extra resources. Result: dipping into the general development cooperation lines. In order to prevent these problems from arising in the future, starting with the budget for the year 2000 (for which preparations stars at the end of 1998), NGOs are now calling on EU Member States not to give any more of these geo-political commitments without new funding, in order to ensure that they do not have a detrimental effect on development cooperation.

Development NGOs call on the European Parliament to use its budgetary power to save the amount allocated to development cooperation lines. This appeal is being launched by the Liaison Committee of Development NGOs to the EU, which comprises around 900 member NGOs from the 15 EU countries.

Press release (EU Development Council 18 May 1998)
Liaison Committee of Development NGOs to the EU (representing a network of over 900 NGO's, including VOICE the network for humanitarian aid)

information for journalists: Sam Biesemaas, Press & E.P. Relations, tel. + 322 743 87 85 (direct line), 743 87 60 (secretariat), GSM no. 0477-268893 (Belgium), fax. 7321961, or Karine Sohet, Secretary of the Development Finance Group, 7438797.

Transnational Associations 50th year

Associations transnationales *50e année*

Some items in recent issues : *Parmi les thèmes traités récemment :*	Issue number : *Numéros :*
Transnational actors in the international system *Les acteurs transnationaux dam le système international*	6/1994, 6/1995, 3/1997, 2/1998.
The recognition of the legal personality of INGOs *La reconnaissance de la personnalité juridique des OING*	3/1986, 3/1990, 5/1990, 3/1995.
Cooperation between INGOs and IGOs *La coopération entre les OING et les OIG*	2/1996, 5/1996, 6/1996,1/1997.
Social movements, trade unions and coopératives *Mouvements sociaux, syndicats et coopératives*	1/1996, 5/1996, 6/1996, 3/1997.
Social and economic development *Développement économique et social*	5/1994, 4/1995, 1/1996,4/1996.
Environmental problems *Les problèmes écologiques*	4/1989, 1/1990, 4/1995, 2/1996.
Humanitarian aid and humanitarian law *L'aide et le droit humanitaires*	2/1992, 4/1992, 2/1994, 2/1996.
Language, communication, education and gender *Langage, communication, éducation et égalité des sexes*	1/1996, 4/1996, 3/1997, 2/1998.
Civil Society and the State *La-société civile et l'Etat*	6/1995, 1/1996, 6/1996, 3/1997.
Internationalism in Science *Science et transnationalité*	6/1997.
Latin American and North-American Associations *Les associations latino-américaines et nord-américaines*	6/1989, 3/1990, 1/1993, 4/1996.
African Associations *Associations africaines*	3/1994,4/1995, 1/1996, 2/1996.
European Associations after Maastricht *Les associations européennes après Maastricht*	1/1995, 2/1997, 1/1998, 2/199S.
Arab Associations *Associations arabes*	1/1998.
Asian Associations *Associations asiatiques*	2/1997.

Some authors / ***ont publié dans nos colonnes ;***
Sami A. Aldeeb, Chadwick Alger, Chérif Bassiouni, Mohammed Bedjaoui, Jan Berting, Maurice Bertrand, Elise Boulding, Boutros Boutros-Ghali, John Clark, Cynthia Cockburn, Jacques Delors, Adama Dieng, Johan Galtung, Susan George, André Gorz, Group of Lisbon, Robin Guthrie, Robert Harris Jürgen Höffner, Alexandre Kiss, Alain Labrousse, Ronnie D. Lipschutz, Marc Luyckx, Elikia M'Bokolo, Morrón Mitchnik, Edgar Morin, Basarab Nicolescu, Ignacio Ramonet, François Rigaux, Nigel Rodley, Wolfgang Sachs, Pierre de Senarclens, Jan Aart Schölte, Vaudana Shiva, Rodolfo Stavenhagen, Rajesh Tandon, Charles Taylor, Peter Waterman.

Transnational Associations 50th year

Associations transnationales 50[e] *année*

Forthcoming topics :

Dans les prochains numéros :

- Changing consumption patterns
  Les nouveaux modes de consommation
- NGOs' losing the moral high ground
  Le spleen des ONG
- NGOs' response to the MAI
  Les réactions des ONG à l'AMI

Articles appearing in the journal are indexed in PAIS (Public Affairs Information Service) and AGRIS (Internacional Information System for the Agricultural Sciences and Technology), FAO.

	Belgique	EU/UE		Rest of Europe Autres pays européens		Rest of the world Hors Europe	
		Surface Mail Voie normale	Airmail Voie aérienne	Surface Mail	Airmail	Surface Mail Voie normale	Airmail
1 YEAR (1998)	BEF 2046	BEF 2380*	BEF 2860*	BEF 2500	BEF 2860	BEF 2560	BEF 3040
2 YEARS (1998-1999)	BEF 3350	BEF 4250*	BEF 4850*	BEF 4490	BEF 5210	BEF 4610	BEF 5570

* VAT 6 % to add if no VAT number / TVA 6 % á ajouter si non assujetti

ORDER FORM / BON DE COMMANDE

Name / Nom : ....

Organisation : ....

Address / Adresse : ....

....

VAT / TVA N° ....

Date .... Signature : ....

☐ Please charge my / Veuillez débiter ☐ Visa card ☐ Eurocard/Mastercard

Card no / Carte n° ☐☐☐☐ ☐☐☐☐ ☐☐☐☐ ☐☐☐☐ Expiry date / Date d'expiration ☐☐☐☐

☐ By cheque to the order of / Par chèque au bénéfice de : Union des Associations Internationales

☐ International postalorder or transfer to our postcheckaccount nr 000-0034699-70
Mandat postal international ou virement à notre compte postal n° 000-0034699-70

☐ Banktransfer to / Virement à :
Bruxelles : Générale de Banque, Agence Magistrat, nr 210-0508283-55
Köln : Generale Bank & Co, nr 1-0672712-90

Please return to / A renvoyer à :

UNION OF INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATIONS / UNION DES ASSOCIATIONS INTERNATIONALES

rue Washington 40 - B-1050 Bruxelles (Belgium) - Fax : (32 2) 646 05 25

Transnational Associations
Associations transnationales

Published by/*Publié par*

Associations (UAI)
(founded 1910)
Issn-0020-6059

rue Washington 40,
1050 Bruxelles (Belgium)
Tel (02) *640* 18 08-
64041 09
Fax(322)646 05 25
E mail: uia@uia.be
WWW:http://www.uia.org

Editeur responsable
Jacques Raeymaeckers
rue Washington 40
1050 Bruxelles (Belgique)
Tél. 02)640 1808-
640 41 09
Télécopie: (322) 646 05 25

Subscription, rate
BF 1.780, or equivalent per
year (6 issues) + postage
BF 270.

Abonnement: FB 1.780 ou
équivalent, par an (6
numéros) + Frais de port
FB 270.

Method of payment
Mode de paiement à utiliser

Bruxelles: Compte chèque
postal n° 000-0034699-70 ou
Compte n° 210-0508283-55
à la Générale de Banque, 253,
avenue Louise, 1050
Bruxelles.

London: Account n°
04552334, National
Westminster Bank Ltd,
21 Lombard Street.

Genève: Compte courant
n° 472.043.30 Q à l'Union
des Banques suisses.

Paris: par virement compte
n° 545150-04200 au Crédit
du Nord, 6-8 boulevard
Haussmann, Paris 75009.